CRITICS OF THE TRANSLATION OF CULTURAL WORDS USING THE PROCEDURE OF NOTES AT THE BOTTOM OF PAGE IN THE ENTROK NOVEL, AN INDONESIAN - ENGLISH NOVEL

A Thesis
Submitted to Letters and Humanities Faculty in Partial Fullfillment of the Requirement for the Degree of Strata One

Irvan Nurviansyah
1111026000009

ENGLISH LETTERS DEPARTMENT
LETTERS AND HUMANITIES FACULTY
STATE ISLAMIC UNIVERSITY OF SYARIF HIDAYATULLAH
JAKARTA
2017
ABSTRACT


This research aimed to criticize the translation of cultural word using the translation procedure of notes at the bottom of the page in *Entrok*, an Indonesian – English novel. The writer used qualitative method to describe the data analysis with related study of translation criticism, cultural words and notes translation procedure by Newmark’s theory. Through this analysis, the result showed that from 13 cultural words, there were 7 cultural words which have its equivalency in the TL such as *dawet, pincuk, wayang kulit, ketoprak, legi, pesugihan* and *kyai*. Meanwhile, there were 6 cultural words which did not have any equivalency such as *rujak, pecel, rawon, lodeh, ongko wolu*, and *ampyang*. It did not show any equivalency in the TL, because the translation of them could not give a complete message for the target readers in the TL. This research also revealed that the using of the translation procedure of notes at the bottom of the page could not always give a complete naturalness in the TL.

**Keywords:** Translation Criticism, Cultural Words, Translation Procedure of Notes
APPROVEMENT

CRITICS OF THE TRANSLATION OF CULTURAL WORDS USING THE PROCEDURE OF NOTES AT THE BOTTOM OF PAGE IN THE ENTROK NOVEL, AN INDONESIAN-ENGLISH NOVEL

A Thesis
Submitted to Faculty of Adab and Humanities
in Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements for the Degree of Strata One

IRVAN NURVIANSYAH
NIM. 1111026000009

Approved By:

Moh. Iqbal Firdaus, M. Hum.
NIP.
(Day/Date: Tuesday, 30 May 2017)

ENGLISH LETTERS DEPARTMENT
FACULTY OF ADAB AND HUMANITIES
STATE ISLAMIC UNIVERSITY SYARIF HIDAYATULLAH
JAKARTA
2017
Name : Irvan Nurviansyah
NIM : 1111026000009
Title : Critics of the Translation of Cultural Words Using the Procedure of Notes at the Bottom of Page in the Entrok Novel, an Indonesian-English Novel

The thesis entitled above has been defended before the Letters and Humanities Faculty’s Examination Committee on August 09th 2017. The thesis has already been accepted as a partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of strata one.

Jakarta, August 09th 2017

Examination Committee

1. Drs. Saeufdin, M.Pd.
   NIP. 19640710 199303 1 006
   (Chair Person) 10/10/2017

2. Elve Oktaviyani, M.Hum.
   NIP. 19781003 200112 2 002
   (Secretary) 10/10/2017

   NIP.
   (Advisor) 03/10/2017

   NIP. 19731220 199903 2 004
   (Examiner) 29/09/2017

5. M. Agus Suriadi, M.Hum
   NIP. 19780801 201411 1 001
   (Examiner II) 03/10/2017
DECLARATION

I hereby declare that this submission is my own work and that, to the best of my knowledge and belief, it contains no material previously published or written by another person nor material which to a substantial extent has been accepted for the award of any other degree or diploma of the university or other institute of higher learning, except where due acknowledgement has been made in the text.

Jakarta, May 2017

Irwan Nurviansyah
ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

All praises be to Allah SWT the most Gracious and Merciful for all favor and bless to the writer in completing this thesis. Peace and salutation be upon the greatest prophet Muhammad SAW, his family, compains and adherents.

On this occasion, the writer would like to express his gratitude to his parents father and mother, H. Nurcholis Abdul Aziz and Hj. Tatiek Sulistyati for the useful advice and financial support. The writer also wants to say thanks to his brother Riza Luthi Latif and Rizky Agustian for his support and advice; thanks for being brother that he can rely on, also for her little sister Aulia Zahra.

The writer also wants to say many thanks to his advisor, Mr. Iqbal Firdaus M. Hum., for his time, advice, patient, and kindness in guiding the writer to finish this thesis.

The writer also would like to express his gratitude to who had been supported the writer to the following people:

1. Prof. Dr. Sukron Kamil, MA., the Dean of Letters and Humanities Faculty.
2. Drs. Saefuddin, M. Pd., the Head of English Letters Department.
3. Elve Oktaviani, M. Hum., the Secretary of English Letters Department.
4. All lecturers of English Letters Department who give her the knowledges during her studies.
5. All librarians in the Main Library of UIN Jakarta, FAH UIN Library, and the Main Library of Universitas Indonesia who help him to get many useful references for this thesis.

6. All English Letters Student Class of 2011 who have been mutually telling each other to finish the thesis.

7. The writer’s friends Ahmad Fariz, Ardhian Bangga, Akrom, Dicky, Reza, Rizulmi, Fathan, Satria, Kustiana, Rohim, Ichwan, Septian, Wahid. Thanks for being his friend that understand him behave well.

8. All English Letters Student Class of 2011, especially ELD A and translation class.

May Allah bless all of them and gives them like what they gave to the writer, Amiin. The writer realizes that there are so many mistakes in this thesis and hopefully this thesis will be useful to the reader who are interesting with the literary translation research.
TABLE OF CONTENTS

ABSTRACT ........................................................................................................ i
APPROVEMENT ................................................................................................ ii
LEGALIZATION ................................................................................................ iii
DECLARATION ................................................................................................ iv
ACKNOWLEDGMENT .................................................................................. v
TABLE OF CONTENTS ........................................................................... vii

CHAPTER I INTRODUCTION ................................................................. 1
A. Background of Study ................................................................. 1
B. Focus of Study ........................................................................ 3
C. Research Question ................................................................. 4
D. Significant of The Study ....................................................... 4
E. Research Methodology ........................................................... 4

CHAPTER II THEORITICAL DESCRIPTION ...................................... 7
A. Previous Research ................................................................. 7
B. Concepts ................................................................................. 10
   1. Definition of Translation .................................................. 10
   2. Translation Criticism ......................................................... 11
   3. The Concept of Turn in Translation Studies. ............ 13
      a. The Linguistics Turn .................................................. 14
      Werner Koller Concept of Equivalence...................... 17
      Katharina Reiss Translation Criticism
CHAPTER III  DATA ANALYSIS  ........................................ 55

A. Data Description ................................................. 55

B. Data Analysis ................................................... 56
CHAPTER I
INTRODUCTION

A. Background of Study

Language is the system of communication in speech and writing that is used by people of a particular country to transfer their thought. All people used a language to communicate each other both oral and written. Language plays an important role in human life. Since the development of translation, the difference of a language is no longer as a barrier to convey of information. Translation is very useful and needed by human. By the translation, communication between human beings in various part of the world can be conveyed effectively.

Translation is a process conducted in language, a process of changing a text in one language to another language. Besides, translation is more than transferring a text in source language into target language; it is also looking for the equivalent meaning of message in the source language to be transferred into target language. The translator should master both of the languages, the source language and target language because language is not only the composition of a letter but also bound with the culture. In the fact, the process of translation is not simply with just render the meaning once, but we should go back by looking to the original version in order to get the most equivalent translation in the target text. This vigilance has been done by a translator in order to produce a good translation product and the target readers can accept the text. In addition, the reader has same interpretation with the original.
There are many texts have been translated at this time, such as journalism text, religious text, philosophical text, literary text, etc. Literary text like a novel is one of the difficult texts to translate because of the differences of literary style between source language and target language.

One of the problems in translating a novel is translating a word or a phrase that is bound with culture, in which the translator must find direct lexical equivalent for a thing or event that is unknown (foreign) in the receptor language culture. The word or phrase is mentioned as cultural words. Transmitting the cultural element through literary translation is a complicated task since the culture is a complex collection of experiences which the condition of daily life; it includes history, social, religion, traditional customs, and everyday usage. In other word, a translator has difficulty in finding an equivalent of cultural words because there is no direct and right equivalent which is used to express the messages of source language in word or phrase of receptor language.

As one of the way out, the translator can put the additional information by using a footnote procedure or the other procedure based on the cultural word contained in the novel. The translator must be careful in giving the additional information because the concept of a cultural word in an original language is not well understood by the target language readers.

According to Sayogie “translation should have a similar experience with the experience gained by the reader of original version”. Therefore, the

---

translator should not make them difficult while comprehending the story. A word or vocabulary that is used should be easily understood by the readers.

In a novel entitled *The Year of The Voiceless*, the authors has written a lot of cultural word, for example the cultural word *Rawon*. Based on KBBI, *rawon* means as *makanan berkuah yang dibuat dari irisan daging dengan bumbu utama keluak*. But, the translator translates *Rawon* by using the procedure of notes in the type notes at the bottom of page into *(beef stew)*.

Here, the writer considers that the concept between *Rawon* in the SL is different from the *beef stew* in the TL. The concept of *Rawon* in the SL is known as a food which has dark colored sauce. Meanwhile the concept of *beef stew* in the TL is known as a food which has brighter sauce color and lots of vegetables. These inequalities can increase the misinterpretation for the target reader while understanding the cultural word *rawon*.

Based on this explanation, the writer is interested to conducting a research about the translation procedure of cultural word, specifically the cultural word that is translated using the procedure of notes and its equivalency.

**B. Focus of Study**

According to the previous explanation in the background of study, this research will be limited by focusing on the analysis of the kinds of translation procedure of notes which are used to translate the cultural words by using Newmark’s theory and its equivalence by using Nida and Taber’s theory in the

---

2 KBBI Online Dictionary, accesses on 20 February
Indonesian novel entitle *Entrok* and its English translation novel entitle *The Year of Voiceless*.

C. Research Questions

According to the background of the research above, the problems that will be discussed on this research are:

1. What kind of translation procedure of notes which is used by the translator to translate the cultural word in the *Entrok* novel?

2. How does the using of the translation procedure of notes at the bottom of page in translating the cultural words in *Entrok* novel?

D. Significance of Study

The writer hopes that this research will give a new contribution and enlarge the knowledge in translation study especially about the using of notes procedure in translating the cultural words and its equivalency in the target language. Besides, the writer hopes that this research can be one of the references for English Letters Department student in conducting the research about the translation procedure of note in cultural word and its equivalency in the near future.

E. Research Methodology

1. The Objective of Research

The objective of this research is trying to find and analyze the procedure of notes which is commonly used to translate the cultural word in *Entrok* novel including analyzing the equivalency of the using of the translation procedure of
notes in translating the cultural words from *Entrok* novel to its English translation *The Year of Voiceless*.

2. The Method of Research

This research uses descriptive qualitative method. Through this method, the writer will describe the kind of procedure of notes which are applied to translate the cultural words in the novel. In addition, the writer will also analyze the equivalency of the cultural words in the TL.

3. The Technique of Collecting Data

The technique of collecting data which is used in this study is the data card. Through this technique, the writer will choose some data analysis that is considered problematic in the translation of the overall data findings. In this study, there are 29 cultural words translated using the translation procedure of notes, but the writer uses only 15 cultural words has the problematic in translation and its equivalency.

4. The Technique of Data Analysis

In this research the writer takes some steps to collecting and analyzing the data:

a. Reading the *Entrok* novel and its translation *The Year of Voiceless*

b. Signing the procedures of notes which are applied to translate the cultural words

c. Classifying the procedure of notes which are applied to translate the cultural words into a table

d. Analyzing kinds of procedure of notes which are applied to translate the cultural words based on Newmark’s theory
e. Analyzing the equivalency of the cultural word translation in *Entrok* novel and its translation *The Year of Voiceless* based on Nida and Taber’s theory

f. Concluding the data analysis

5. **The Instrument of the Research**

The writer acts as the instrument of the research that collects, reads, and analyzes the data about kinds of translation procedure of notes which is used to translate the cultural word in *Entrok* novel including its equivalency while translating the cultural word from *Entrok* novel to *The Year of Voiceless* novel.

6. **The Unit of Analysis**

The unit of analysis in this research is the Indonesian novel entitles *Entrok* written by Okky Madasari in 2010 and its English translation entitles *The Year of The Voiceless* translated by Nurhayat Indriyatno Mohammed in 2013. This novel tells a story about how Indonesians live under the ruthless dictatorship of Suharto’s regime and how they struggled to survive under oppression of the military's dominance. This novel also included the feminism in the story. The original book and its translation were published by PT. Gramedia Pustaka Utama.
CHAPTER II
THEORITICAL DESCRIPTION

A. Previous Researches

1. Footnotes for Meaningful Translations of the New Testament

This research is written by Richard C. Blight in 2005. The aim of the research is to find the footnotes which are applied in translating the New Testament. The translation of scripture is not the easiest one; they need to communicate the same message that the biblical authors intended the original readers to understand. In order to do this, the translators know they need to provide the background of information that the authors counted on the original readers to have in mind as they read the text. After doing the analysis, the writer found that there are some kinds of footnote which is applied such as “Lilies of the field” (Matt. 6:28) may be translated with generic word “flower of the field” or with the generic word plus with description “wild flower of the fields”. It’s also found that there is footnote which is applied for the unknown geographic location; sometimes a footnote would be helpful. An example is in Luke 5:1, where the Lake of Gennesaret is named. To avoid the impression that this different body of water, a footnote can give information the Lake of Gennesaret is another name for Lake of Galilee. In conclusion, the result shows that translating a bible in this case

---

New Testament can be a difficulty for a translator since there are cultural
differences between the source language and target language. These cultural
differences led to the use of different terms in the use of food menu term from
one language to another language. A broad knowledge of translator plays an
important role in overcome this problem. The selection of translation
procedures of notes also need by translator to produce a good translation.
Translation procedure of notes could became one of the suitable procedure to
solve this problem, by using this procedure the translator can be more
responsible based on the translation of the terms to the target reader.

2. The Translation Procedures in Translating the Cultural Words in the Young
Adult Novel.  

This research is written by Shermy Ismawati. The purpose of this
research is to find out the most frequently procedure of translation which are
used in translating the cultural words in the novel Eragon. The writer
classifies the type of cultural words based on Newmark’s cultural categories.
In the research, writer found there are some cultural categories in the novel
there is ecology, material, social and organization. From that point, the
highest position for cultural word in this research is material culture than
those in other domain. After that the writer used the translation procedure
from Newmark to translate it. The result shows that the cultural equivalent is

---

the most frequently procedure used to translate the cultural words in the novel. The second procedure that is mostly used in translating the cultural words in the novel is couplets and naturalization becomes the third rank of the translation procedure used in the novel. In short, the translation procedure helps the readers in understanding the story that the translation of Eragon become easily to understand and readable by the readers since the cultural words has been translated well.

3. An Analysis of Culture-specific Items in the Persian Translation of “Dubliners” Based on Newmark Model

This research is written by Seyed Mohammad Hosseini Maasoum in December 2011. The aim of the research is to find the way to handle with the CSIs (Culture Specific Item) in the story based on Newmark’s model. Before doing the analysis, the writer classifies the CSIs and its strategies to translate them based on Newmark’s model. After doing the analysis, the writer found that the CSIs which are occurring in the story are ecology, material culture, social culture, organizations, gesture and habits. But, the material culture (like food and clothes) and organizations occurred more frequently than those in other domains. Among all strategies of Newmark that is used to translate the CSIs general words and borrowing are the most frequent strategies that are used by the translator to cope with the lexical gap. Moreover, using these

---

strategies is effective in many cases and the translator can make his translation more authentic and tangible in this way.

B. Concepts

1. Definition of Translation

There are so many scholars that define translation. Taking into consideration that this study is literary study, the writer agrees with the definition of translation that are proposed by Hatim and Mason. They state that the translation is “an act of communication which attempts to relay, across cultural and linguistic boundaries, another act of communication (which may have been intended for different readers or hearers).”\(^4\) In this case, a translator is the receiver of the message of source language then he acts as sender to the receptor language.\(^5\) In other words, a translator has two tasks, first he must be a good receiver that is willing to understand what the authors mean in the source text, and secondly he acts as sender in which he must be able to render the sense what he had got accurately to the readers.\(^6\)

According to Nida and Taber, translating is consists in reproducing in the receptor language to the closest natural equivalent of the source language message, first in terms of meaning and secondly in terms of style.\(^7\) From three opinions above, it can be concluded that translation is an act of

communication that convey the message from source language to target language. In the process of translating have several obstacles, such as rules established on the basic of the language itself. The differences in structure, semantics of language, and cultural background also affect the source language (SL) and target language (TL). In which the cultural factors itself may include the language differences, social systems, religious systems, material culture, ecology, etc.

The good translation refers to the equivalence of the translation, which focuses on the adjustment of meanings supported by various factors such as culture, community development and vocabulary uses. The difficulty of finding the appropriate equivalent in the SL often occurs in translation. This problem called by “non-equivalence at the word level” this is the conditions in which the SL does not have a direct equivalent to the word that appears in TL (Baker, 1992).

Basically, translation is shift message from source language into different target language, according to the contents of message of the source language, and the using a natural method disclosure or expression of the target language.

2. Translation Criticism

According to Newmark, translation criticism is an essential link between the translation theory and its practice. It is because sometimes the

---

method of the translator while doing the translation is not always acceptable for the target readers in the SL. It is also an enjoyable and instructive exercise if the writer is criticizing someone else’s translation or even better two or more translations of the same text. Doing the criticisms is not only reading the original one but also comparing between the original and the translation. It is also not about how good or bad the translation is, but it is about assessing the translation by its standard of referential and pragmatic accuracy. If this is inappropriate and rather futile, because there is so much to correct, the writer can consider the reason why the translator has apparently transferred or changed the mood drastically; is he or she has the right to change or unchanging and fixed in a short of eternity or how far is the translator entitled to get away from the words, to devote himself to the message, the sense and the spirit.

On the other hand, translation criticism is an essential component in a translation course. Firstly, it is because it improves the competency of the translator. Second, it expands the knowledge and understanding of the writer’s language and foreign language as well as perhaps of the topic. Third, it is presenting the writer with options and help to sort out the idea about translation. As an academic discipline, translation criticisms ought to be the cornerstone of any course in comparative literature or literature in translation and a component of any professional translation course with the appropriate text-type, for instance legal or engineering document, as an exercise for criticisms and discussion.
3. The Concept of “TURN” in Translation Studies

Translation studies which deals with phenomena and the theory of translation is a young discipline as an academic field.

Holmes states that Translation Studies has two fundamental goals:

1) To describe the ‘phenomena of translating and translation as they manifest themselves in the world of our experience’, and 2) to establish general principles by means of which these phenomena can be explained.10

It means that the Translation Studies shall benefit from different disciplines such as linguistics, sociology, cultural studies, etc. translation studies need to be interdisciplinary due to its nature. With the contributions of the abovementioned disciplines, translation studies have made significant progress. As Mary Snell-Hornby states, the concept of the “turn” as understood here is ideally a paradigmatic change, a marked “bend in the road” involving a distinct change in direction.11 However, there are some conditions for perceiving this change as a “turn”. Snell-Hornby claims that when the change is clearly visible, radical and has striking effect in order to redefine the subject, it can be acknowledged as a “turn”. Different scholars have various views about the turns and definitions of translation in different ways since the 1950’s as the variety definitions of translation may become effective in shaping the turns in translation studies.

Translation is a broad concept and may be understood in many ways such as

---

a process, a product or etc. Studies in the field of translation have been affected by the variety of translation definitions and it may lead to develop new viewpoints in the translation. It could be realized that there are two main turns, namely the linguistic turn and the cultural turns.

**a. The Linguistic Turn**

Linguistic turn is closely related to the translation from the perspective of linguistics. Theories and approaches within the linguistic turn are generally text-based, source oriented, prescriptive and absolutely linguistic. According to linguists such as Catford, Nida; translation should be faithful and represent the original text accurately. In the linguistic turn, studies in the field of translation have a relation with modern linguistic theory and structuralism of Saussure. Many translation scholars apply the structural approach to translation. For instance, Roman Jakobson, Eugene Nida, Anton Popovic, Peter Newmark, John Catford, Werner Koller and so many other scholars have contributed to the development of studies in the field of translation. In order to understand the linguistic turn thoroughly, some scholars approaches to translation need to be explained. For instance, linguistic meaning and equivalence are the key elements for the Russian structuralize Roman Jakobson. In his essay *On Linguistic Aspects of Translation* he classifies three types of translation:

1) Intralingual translation or rewording is an interpretation of verbal signs by means of other signs of the same language
2) Interlingual translation or translation proper is an interpretation of verbal signs by means of some other language.

3) Intersemiotic translation or transmutation is an interpretation of verbal signs by means of signs of nonverbal sign systems.¹²

Equivalence is connected to the interlingual form of translation. For Jakobson, there are two equivalent messages in two different codes in this translation type. His approach to translation is related to lexical and grammatical differences between languages. Equivalence is also a concept for Eugene A. Nida.

According to Nida, a translation must meet the following basic requirements: 1) making sense, 2) reflecting the spirit of the original, 3) having natural form of expression, and 4) creating a similar response.¹³ He divides the equivalence into two groups: formal equivalence and dynamic equivalence. While formal equivalence focuses on the form and content of the source text, dynamic equivalence which is also later termed as functional equivalence intends to reach the complete naturalness of expression. He aims at a similar response between the target audience and target text. He uses the term functional equivalence to avoid possible misunderstandings instead of dynamic equivalence.¹⁴

Peter Newmark regards translation as the change of meaning between two languages. He is influenced by the work of Nida. His thoughts on translation are based on textual analysis. He feels that a success of equivalent effect is illusory. He distinguishes two types of translation: communicative translation and semantic translation. He states:

Communicative translation attempts to produce on its readers an effect as close as possible to that obtained on the readers of the original. Semantic translation attempts to render, as closely as the semantic and syntactic structures of the second language allow, the exact contextual meaning of the original.¹⁵

From these descriptions, it can be understood that semantic translation has some resemblances to Nida formal equivalence while communicative translation has shown parallelism to Nida dynamic equivalence. However, Newmark translation types have generally received less attention than Nida formal and dynamic equivalence. According to Munday, this may be because Newmark raises the same points concerning the translation process and the importance of the TT reader. (2010: 46)

Catford, likewise, defines translation as replacement of textual material between two languages. He is the first scholar who applied the term “shift” to translation studies in his book titled *A Linguistic Theory of Translation* (1965). His systematic linguistic approach to translation studies focuses on the relationship between textual equivalence and formal correspondence. He sees that if the TT is equivalent to the ST, there is a

---

textual equivalence; on the other hand, if the TT is close to the ST, there is a formal correspondence.

In this turn, translation was seen as the transfer of languages. The main concern was to provide equivalence. The consideration of context was neglected. Moreover, the definitions of translation were prescriptive rather than descriptive in the linguistic turn. Nevertheless, many linguistic theories (e.g. Chomsky’s generative grammar, etc) were applied to studies in the field of translation and this helped the studies progress quickly. However, the understanding of translation was limited to linguistic level. In other words, translation only focuses on the relationship between languages. The chosen approaches to be evaluated under the linguistic turn have been examined below.

Werner Koller’s “The Concept of Equivalence” and “Text Analysis”

Koller defines the translation from the point of linguistic and text-theoretical perspective. According to Koller, translation can be understood as the result of a text processing activity, by means of which a source-language text is transposed into a target-language text.16 From this definition, it has been realized that there is a relationship between source and target texts and this relation has shown itself as equivalence.

Koller has carried out significant works on the concept of equivalence. He has linked the concept of equivalence with its own relevant

---

term correspondence. For Koller, the parameters of both correspondence and equivalence differ from each other.

Correspondence means comparing two language systems and describing similarities and differences contrastively and this term is usually evaluated within the context of contrastive linguistics. Its parameters are Saussure’s. The identification of false friends, signs of lexical, syntactic and morphological interferences can be given as examples of these parameters. Conversely, equivalence is associated with equivalent items in ST-TT pairs. Saussure parole is the parameter. Therefore, the knowledge of correspondences is an indication of competence in foreign language while the knowledge and providing the equivalence is an indication of competence in translation. However, there is still no consensus what exactly should be equivalent. Koller remarks:

Equivalence is a relative concept in several respects: it is determined on the one hand by the historical-cultural conditions under which texts (original as much as secondary ones) are produced and received in the target culture, and on the other by a range of sometimes contradictory and scarcely reconcilable linguistic-textual and extra-linguistic factors and conditions.

Texts in various languages can be equivalent either in different degrees (the text is fully or partially equivalent) or in different levels (the text is equivalent in terms of grammar, lexis, semantics etc.) or in different ranks (the text is equivalent word by word, phrase to phrase etc.).

---

Therefore, Koller suggests five different types of equivalence:

1) Denotative equivalence is related to equivalence of the extralinguistic content of a text.

2) Connotative equivalence deals with the lexical choices, especially between near-synonyms.

3) Text-normative equivalence is related to certain text types, with different kinds of texts behaving in different ways.

4) Pragmatic equivalence is related to the recipient for whom the translation is “specially designed”.

5) Formal equivalence is related to certain aesthetics and the form of the text, including individual stylistic features of the ST (House, 1997: 25).

Koller distinguishes these types of equivalence considering their research. After describing these types, he stresses their importance for helping the translator. He points out:

With every text as a whole, and also with every segment of text, the translator who consciously makes such a choice must set up a hierarchy of values to be preserved in translation: from this he can derive a hierarchy of equivalence requirements for the text or segment in question. This in turn must be preceded by a transnationally relevant text analysis. It is an urgent task of translation theory and one on which no more than some preliminary work has so far been done to develop methodology and conceptual apparatus for this kind of text analysis, and bring together and systematize such analyses in terms of transnationally relevant typologies of textual features.


As Koller types of equivalences are concerned, the translator needs to decide hierarchy of equivalence for each type of text. Translator needs to use a “translation oriented text analysis” in this establishing of equivalence process in order to determine the appropriate criteria among the five types. However; the vital point is that the equivalences must be ordered hierarchically considering their communicative situation.

Koller’s purpose is to develop a scientific mode of criticism that can improve the quality of translations. Koller points out that there is a necessity of comprehensive linguistic model for translation quality assessment. Such a model should include:

1) Source text criticism with a view to transferability into the target language
2) Translation comparison in which the particular methods used in the translation are described
3) Evaluation of the translation according to “adequate” or “non-adequate” terms rather than general criteria such as “faithful” or “unfaithful”.

Koller’s approach is an attempt to describe the distinct qualities of ST and TT elements which can be shared. These elements vary from extra linguistic contents to formal aesthetic features. Each of these variations can correspond to a different type of equivalence.

---

Koller offers a checklist for translation relevant text analysis under the headings of:

- language function;
- content characteristics;
- language-stylistic characteristics;
- formal-aesthetic characteristics;
- pragmatic characteristics

Consequentially, it can be noted that Koller linguistic-textual approach in translation studies assumes that translations are characterized by a double linkage: the first one is its link to the ST and the second one is its communicative conditions on the receiver.

From the linguistic-textual perspective, the extra-linguistic circumstances, the connotations, norms of the text and language, receiver and the aesthetic features have greater importance in the equivalence frameworks.

Certainly, Koller thoughts and approach have been also criticized. Particularly, Koller five references of equivalence types have remained strangely intact over the years. His concept of equivalence is either too vague or too bound for language systems. Snell-Hornby has the view that equivalence is unsuitable as a basic concept in translation theory.

---

To sum up, Koller approach is like a general outline with no suggestions for operations despite the enlightening and fruitful ideas. Moreover, it can be noted that Koller five equivalence frameworks force the translator to choose one type of these equivalence. For example, a text can include rhyme as a stylistic pattern so that the translator might want to maintain and protect this rhyme, thus achieving “formal-aesthetic equivalence” at the expense of “denotative equivalence”.

**Katharina Reiss Approach to Translation Criticism**

Katharina Reiss has suggested her translation criticism approach in her book entitled *Translation Criticism: The Potentials and Limitations: Categories and Criteria for Translation Quality Assessment* (2000). In her book, she discusses three different categories for the possibility of an objective criticism by analyzing the results of the translation process. Reiss divides these categories into three groups: literary category, language category, and pragmatic category. To understand Reiss translation criticism approach, these three categories will be explained in the following paragraphs.

Katharina Reiss defined literature as the whole range of written expressions in a given language. As she acknowledges any written text in a language as literature, any text can be a basis for translation. Therefore, Reiss firstly discuss the literary category which focuses on text types. The

---

assessment of a translation begins with a determination of its text type. Once the text type is determined and the appropriate strategy for translation is chosen, the relevant criteria to be assessed the degree whether the translator has met the text type accurately. In other words, it accordingly changes the type of text. Reiss explains this circumstance as such:

(...) in a content-focused text, it is whether primary concern has been shown for accuracy of data; in a form-focused text, whether special attention beyond the general concern for accuracy of information has been paid so that rhetorical structures will achieve a comparable aesthetic effect; in an appeal-focused text, whether it achieves the purpose intended by the original; (...)27

To sum up, the literary category which constitutes the first part of Reiss translation criticism approach deals with text type. In this category, the critic needs to decide the source text type. After the literary character of a translation has been determined, the critic moves on to the next step. It is the next category- a language category which deals with the linguistic elements.

Reiss language category which is the second category in her translation criticism approach dwells on the language style, linguistic features and their equivalents in TL.

Under this category, details of the translation process which reveals the linguistic features of the SL in the TL are examined.28 The semantic elements, the lexical elements, the grammatical elements and the stylistic elements are taken into consideration in this category.

These elements will be explained below respectively.

The semantic elements are critical factors while protecting both content and meaning of the ST. If the translator has misunderstood the words or misinterpret the meaning, this situation can be a problem. Then, it offers an invitation for the critic. In order to avoid this condition, the linguistic context needs to be examined carefully. Afterwards, the translator determines semantic equivalence.

As for the lexical elements, Reiss states that the standard for the lexical components must be adequacy.\textsuperscript{29} Therefore, the critic needs to decide the elements of the ST are sufficiently given in the TT on the lexical level or not. It can mostly be seen when the translator has an achievement while translating the technical terminology, idioms, false friends etc.

The other element taken into consideration under the language category is the grammatical elements. The concept of correctness is the criteria for the evaluation of the translation from the perspective of grammatical components of the ST. As long as there is no dominant factor in the nature of the text, the morphology and syntax of the TL need to come fore. If semantic and stylistic aspects of the grammatical structure of the text are successfully translated, grammatical correctness can be pleasing.

The last element examined in the language category of Reiss approach is the stylistic elements. In some cases, the author’s stylistic aspects can differentiate from the normal language usage. Therefore, it

\textsuperscript{29} \textit{Ibid}, p. 57
should be examined that the translation includes standard, individual or contemporary usage of stylistic components of the TT or not. Then, the critic has to decide whether the text in the TL exhibits complete correspondence.  

This last criterion has especially importance of the assessment of form-focused and appeal-focused texts since they have much more stylistic aspects than the other text types.

In the pragmatic category, extra-linguistic determinants are taken into consideration. Unless the extra-linguistic components of both the source and target texts are considered, the evaluation will be unsatisfactory. The extra-linguistic components are important as well as the linguistic elements. The extra-linguistic determinants contain a variety of factors. They are called determinants since all of these factors have an influence on the linguistic form of the text. In her book, Reiss quoted from Mounin the following conclusion:  

Translation today does not mean simply observing the structural and linguistic meaning of the text, its lexical and syntactic content, but rather the whole meaning of the statement, including its environment, century, culture, and if necessary the whole civilization which produced it (Mounin cited in Reiss, 2000: 68).

The extra-linguistic determinants deals with the immediate situation, the subject matter, the time factor, the place factor, the audience factor, the speaker factor and affective implications. The extra-linguistic factors can allow an author to diminish the linguistic form of the message to be delivered as text receivers can complete the rest of the situation

---

*Ibid*, p. 63
by his/her own language. It has to be done with the immediate context, not with a complete work. The other extra-linguistic factor affecting the linguistic form of the text is the subject matter. The translator needs to be familiar with the texts field. As Mounin states that it is not enough to know the words— it is necessary to know what the words are about (cited in Reiss, 2000: 70). The subject matter must be understood by the critic as well.

When the text is associated with the particular time, the time factor becomes relevant. For instance, while translating an old text, the choice of words, figures of speech etc. should be compatible with the ST. Furthermore, the time factor has another sense for translation criticism. The translation which has been published in old times needs not to be evaluated by the same standards as a recent translation of the text since the original language of the ST cannot change but the TL is changing. The time factor is especially shows itself in the form-focused and appeal-focused texts.

According to Reiss, the time factor is very complex and its consideration demands sophisticated sensitivities both linguistically and stylistically. The more difficult factor than the time factor for translator is the place factor. The place factor consists of all the characteristics of the country and culture. If the target culture lacks similar kinds of characteristics, the translation becomes a difficult task. The audience factor is explicit in the common idiomatic expressions, metaphors etc. It depends on the text type. It has a process of decoding. Therefore, the receiver of the

---

31 Ibid, p. 73
text in the target culture should understand the text with his/her own cultural context. The speaker factor refers to the speaker-related determinants which affect the language of the author in lexical, grammatical and stylistic levels. Lastly, affective implications include the emotional determinants affecting lexical and stylistic matters.

Thus far, it has been discussed the possibility of an objective translation criticism by examining the results of the process under three different categories. These categories are literary category (text types), language category (linguistic elements) and pragmatic category (non-linguistic determinants). However, three principal categories of Reiss for translation criticism need to be supplemented by other perspectives. As Reiss claims that translation methods vary from the norms, she adds functional and personal category to these three categories.32

The functional category is a guideline for guiding principle for judging renderings.33 The texts can have special purposes. Therefore, in this category, the translation should be assessed in the light of special purpose instead of the text type.

The other category, the personal one copes with two components: the interpretive skill of the translator and the individual personality of the translator. The personal category can restrict the critic to make absolute judgments.

32 Ibid, p. 89
33 Ibid, p. 92
To sum up, Reiss summarizes the discussion for potentials and limitations of an objective translation criticism as follows:

1. Translation criticism is proper if the text-oriented translation method is chosen considering the text types, linguistic elements of the texts and the non-linguistic determinants affecting the text.

2. Translation criticism is proper if the goal-oriented translation method addressing to special function or readership is carefully examined.

3. Both text-oriented and goal-oriented methods of translation can be affected by subjective factors including the personality of the translator.

4. The translation criticism, either text-oriented or goal-oriented can be proper if these subjective factors are taken into consideration.\(^{34}\)

In her approach, Reiss has attempted to develop a general framework of translation criticism by taking many factors into consideration. She has ranged the standards for different text types. Reiss text typology constitutes the first part for determining the literary, linguistic and pragmatic categories which provide references to translations to be assessed. Then, she has added functional and personal categories to her approach. Reiss approach has been pioneer for many other methods of

\(^{34}\) *Ibid*, p. 114
translation criticism. One of the most important one is Juliane Houses model which examines the translation from the perspective of quality.

b. The Cultural Turn

Context has gained importance after the linguistic turn on studies in the field of translation. As a result of this importance, many scholars try to redefine translation. Bassnett and Lefevere have great influence among these scholars. While Bassnett highlights the importance of context, Lefevere regards the translation as rewriting. They take the cultural factors into consideration. This leads to shift of paradigm from linguistic to culture and their definition of translation studies causes the cultural turn.

The cultural turn in translation studies can be considered as a part of cultural turn that took place in the humanities in the late 1980s and early 1990s, and has altered the shape of many traditional subjects.\(^\text{35}\) The cultural turn has emerged as a reaction to the linguistic turn. As discussed before, the definitions and perceptions of translation have been influenced by the ideas of structuralism which was effective in the linguistic turn. The understanding of translation has changed and improved with the introduction of more factors such as context, culture, ideology and so on. The concept of translation has been redefined. The most influential definitions are proposed by Bassnett and Lefevere. As mentioned above, Bassnets and Lefevere definitions of translation brings the cultural turn.

The cultural turn was firstly appeared in the anthology *Translation, History and Culture: A Sourcebook* (1992) edited by Andre Lefevere. Theories and approaches under the scope of this turn are generally descriptive and target-text oriented. The vocal point is not the text level. Translation has moved beyond the text level and it has pointed out that the purpose of the cultural turn is to define the relation between the translation and culture. In this turn, translation has no longer been defined as transcoding the linguistic units. In other words, translation studies have changed its perspective from reproducing the meanings by providing equivalence to constituting the text in a given socio-cultural context. The focus of translation has shifted from language to context. In the cultural turn, translation has been seen as rewriting. Therefore, the scope of translation has been widened. The target text gained importance since it has not been assessed as a secondary position.

The cultural turn deals with the TT and its cultural context. In this turn, it is inevitable for a translation to render the meaning of the ST for the manipulation of source culture when the context has been taken into consideration. Therefore, each translation includes ideology and poetics to some extent. While describing and explaining the existing target text, ideas, ideologies, conventions, norms, etc. Has a great role as well as the translation of TT. To sum up, translation studies have experienced two main points during the cultural turn. The first one is the shift from source-oriented theories to target-oriented theories. The second one is to take
cultural factors into consideration. After explaining the cultural turn in translation studies, the following sections will include the chosen translation criticism approaches namely Van den Broeck translation criticism model and Gideon Toury approach to translation criticism which can be assessed under the scope of the cultural turn.

**Raymond Van Den Broeck’s Model of Translation Criticism**

Raymond van den Broeck offers a model of translation criticism in his paper *Second Thoughts on Translation Criticism: A Model of its Analytic Function* published in 1985. Broeck tries to provide a systematic model of the translated texts.

He begins his paper by stating that translation criticism has been reduced to subjective comments about the target text and listing the translation mistakes. He states: translation criticism (so far as it exists) and, more particularly, the reviewing of translation is left to random set of publicists, ranging from philologists and literary critics familiar with the source language and literature to translators from the same or related languages.

According to Broeck, translation criticism has to be professional. If translation criticism is based on systematic description, it may be objective. Therefore; he suggests a translation criticism model which is based on systematic description. However, Broeck states two preliminary remarks before describing his translation criticism model. Firstly, he clearly expresses that it is an optimum model based on the assumption that the critic
will keep in view the original act of communication and meta-communication.

Secondly, his proposed model is incomplete because it is especially related to one of the three functions of translation criticism developed by Anton Popovic. The model only concerns with the analytic function. However, there are also two other functions

The starting point of Broeck model is a comparative analysis between the source and the target texts. This analysis demands both text structures and the systems of texts. In addition of these two demands, the analysis should include the critic value judgment.

He identifies the criteria for the critics. According to Broeck, the critic evaluations take into consideration the translator poetics and the translational procedure applied by the translator. Moreover, the critics also examine the policies followed by the translator. The aim of such a comparison is to display the degree of factual equivalence between the two texts. Here, Broeck uses factual equivalence as an observable phenomenon that the two texts have the same functional relevant features.

The comparison must be source-oriented and follow the invariant serving as a tertian cooperationist in a comparison. This invariant is the Adequate Translation. It is the term described by Gideon Toury:

The adequate translation is not an actual text, but a hypothetical reconstruction of the textual relations and functions of the ST. Since it comprises only such features, on various levels of description, as are functionally relevant for the structural relationships within the source text and for the structure of the text as a whole, the adequate translation can be
regarded as the optimum (or maximum) reconstruction of all the ST elements possessing textual functions.\textsuperscript{36}

The translation criticism model proposed by Broeck also takes into account the shifts of expressions in the translation. He observes differences between the shifts. Considering Broeck approach, there are two kinds of shifts; obligatory and optional. Obligatory shifts are rule based. They are concerned with the target linguistic and cultural system. Hence, they are not included in regarding the adequacy of the text. On the other hand, optional shifts are governed by the translator norms. Thus, optional shifts are regarded as the interfering with the acceptability of the target texts because of creating a text compatible with the norms of the target systems.

Van den Broeck divides the comparison of the source and target text into three phases:

1) A text emic analysis of the source text. This analysis consists of all linguistic and extra-linguistic components to acquire functional relevance. These components include phonic, lexical, and syntactic elements, language varieties, figures of speech, structures of narration and poetic, elements of text convention (punctuation, italicizing etc.) and so on.

2) A comparison of the target text elements corresponding to these text, considering the various shifts or deviations

corresponding with the source text. While doing this, the methods of contrastive linguistics and stylistics can be used.

3) A general description of the differences between the existing TT/ST and the Adequate Translation. It will show us the factual degree of the equivalences between TT and ST.37

The translation criticism model proposed by Broeck has a different nature. It is not especially interested in the adequacy or correctness of the translation. It copes with the “how” and “why” of the translated texts. By answering these questions, the translator norms and choices can be detected. However, Broeck model does not only include the comparison between the source and the target text. It involves multiple relations between the ST and the system of similar texts written in the same language; between the target texts and its readers; between the TT and other translations and so on.

Gideon Toury “Target-Oriented Approach” Descriptive Translation Studies

Toury approach can be assessed with respect to Descriptive Translation Studies (DTS). Therefore, it can be meaningful to begin with the birth of DTS before stating Toury approach. DTS was first developed in the early 1970s. Initially, the name of DTS was suggested by James Holmes in his seminal article entitled The Name and Nature of Translation Studies (1972). According to Holmes, the main objective of DTS is to describe the

existent translations from different perspectives. He divided DTS into three subcategories as product-oriented, process-oriented and lastly function-oriented.\textsuperscript{38} Moreover, Gideon Toury who adapts Holmes idea of DTS improves it with making some additions and significant contributions. He states that these three subcategories cannot be separated, they are interrelated. In his book titled \textit{Descriptive Translation Studies-And Beyond (1995)}, Toury states the necessity of systematic approach to this discipline as such:

A systematic branch proceeding from clear assumptions and armed with a methodology and research techniques made as explicit as possible and justified within Translation Studies itself. Only a branch of this kind can ensure that the findings of individual studies will be inter-subjectively testable and comparable, and the studies themselves replicable.\textsuperscript{39}

Toury approach is also regarded as a Target-Oriented Approach. This approach aims at reaching a general translation approach. It can be considered as a reaction to normative, prescriptive and synchronic theoretical frameworks. Toury states that translations are the “facts of the culture which hosts them” (1995: 24). Translations are “initiated by target culture” (1995: 27). Therefore; the translations and their translators cannot be thought separate from the culture in which they exist. Toury names his approach as “target-oriented approach” due to this point. This approach deals with a group of relations which control translation activity rather than focusing only one point especially equivalence. Furthermore, this approach

\textsuperscript{38} Holmes, James. \textit{Translated! Papers on Literary Translation and Translation Studies}. Amsterdam: Rodopi, 1994. p. 71

does not take the equivalence concept into consideration since this
approach regards the equivalence concept as prescriptive. Instead, this
approach takes notice of equivalence level that is descriptive and functional
by replaced components chosen from two texts. DTS suggests a functional,
variable, empirical and descriptive concept of equivalence rather than the
traditional, invariant, ideal and prescriptive concept of equivalence. For
Toury, the goal of this approach is to conduct a great number of
studies from different genres of translation produced in various
cultures; then it aims at proposing a series of translational behavior.

Toury proposes three-phase methodology in order for DTS
more objective and systematic:

(1) Situate the text within the target culture system, looking at its
significance or acceptability
(2) Compare the ST and the TT for shifts, identifying
relationships between „coupled pairs” of ST and TT segments
(3) Attempt generalizations, reconstructing the process of
translation for this ST TT pair.  

The main goal of this approach is to combine the socio-cultural
norms and their effects into analysis of translation process. Toury proposes
the term explanatory hypotheses that are made in the translation process
analysis by considering the impossibility to know the fundamental reasons
that lie behind the choices of translators during the formation of target
text. In his model, as the invariant concept, Toury uses „a series of coupled

---

pairs by mapping the TT onto the ST.\textsuperscript{41} This type of comparison is inevitably partial. Accordingly, the three sub-categories of DTS (product-, process-, and function-oriented) compose an assumed translation in this approach. This notion of assumed translation posits three postulates:

(1) The existence of a source text; (2) The existence of a previous transfer of some source text features to the target text; and, as a result of this process, (3) The existence of a set of relations associating the translated text with its source text.\textsuperscript{42}

If the text is assumed to be a translation, it should consist of all these three postulates. Thus, these three postulates help the reader to understand whether a text is a translation or not. However, each type of these three research fields deals with different subjects.

The focal point of product-oriented DTS is to describe individual translations. Process oriented DTS deals with the processes that occurs the translator mind. Lastly, function-oriented DTS searches the function or impact that a translation has in the system of TL socio-cultural situation. Toury gives primary roles over product-, and process-oriented fields.

The target culture begins to translate if there is a gap in the culture and it creates the feeling of something missing. In order to fill this gap, translation becomes necessary. In DTS, a translation has a certain function in the target culture. This certain function absolutely influences the


translation process, the choices, strategies and decisions that are used. Meanwhile, culture-semiotic conditions are directly linked with the translation process, too. Translations play a social role as they have socio-cultural position in the target culture system. However, there are some constraints affecting the translation. According to Toury:

“In its socio-cultural dimension, translation can be described as subject to constraints of several types and varying degree. These extends far beyond the source text, the systemic differences between the languages and textual traditions involved in the act, or even the possibilities and limitations of the cognitive apparatus of the translator as a necessary mediator. In fact, cognition itself is influenced, probably even modified by socio-cultural factors. At any rate, translators performing under different conditions (e.g. translating texts of different kinds, and/or for different audiences) often adopt different strategies, and ultimately come up with different products”.

When all of these factors and constraints are taken into consideration, Toury suggests three translational norms in order to examine the regularity of behavior in the translation process. Toury believes that translation should be the main object of the study of any literary translation. Translation norms form a kind of correspondence between the source and target texts to understand translation process. Norms are the social convention that establish what behavior is suitable or not in a given context at a certain time and place. Toury takes his definition of norm from sociology. He defines norm in the following way:

“norms as the translation of general values or ideas shared by a community – as to what is right or wrong, adequate and inadequate – into performance instructions appropriate for and applicable to

In particular situations, specifying what is prescribed and forbidden as well as what is tolerated and permitted in a certain behavioral dimension.\textsuperscript{44}

Translation norms are not static facts. Norms can be changed due to their nature since they are unstable. Norms of the target culture have a great effect on the translator and the translation process. In this approach, the translator is expected to create a target text which can be appropriate for target culture norms. Norms can be considered a lasting conceptual contribution to the field of translation studies. Although there is a logical classification between norms, it needs to be emphasized that there are no clear cuts. Toury describes three norms: “initial norm”, “preliminary norms” and “operational norms”.

The “initial norm” can be defined as translator choices to adopt either to the source text norms or to the target text norms. This norm determines the choice of closeness to the either set of norms. If the translator move closer to the source text, the translation will be “adequate”; but if the translator move closer to the target text, the translation will be “acceptable”. However, according to Toury, no translation is completely adequate or totally acceptable; shifts either obligatory or non-obligatory are inevitable.

The “preliminary norms” are concerned with interrelated two considerations: the translation policy and the directness of translation. According to Toury, translation policy is defined as those factors that

\textsuperscript{44} Ibid, p. 55
govern the choice of text types, or even of individual texts, to be imported through translation into a particular culture at a particular point in time.\textsuperscript{45}

On the other hand, directness of translation means that discovering whether there is a mediating language between the SL and TL or not. Operational norms can be defined as the decisions that guide the translation process.

Toury divides these norms into two categories: metrical norms and textual-linguistic norms. Toury distinguishes these norms in a following way:

(a) metrical norms, which help determine the macro-structure of the text and govern decisions concerning, for example, translating all or part of the source text, division into chapters, acts, stanzas, paragraphs and the like, and
(b) textual-linguistic norms, which affect the texts micro-level, the detail of sentence construction, word choice, the use of italics or capitals for emphasis, and so on.\textsuperscript{46}

Translational norms are largely descriptive. They are used for determining the activity of translation and the decisions of the translator. It is clear that norms have been effective on the complete process from selection of ST to the word choice during translation process. Toury states that translational norms can be adopted and analyzed through a comparative analysis after the source text is selected. He explains his analysis method as such:

\textsuperscript{45} Ibid, p. 58
(1) Every comparison is partial only: it is not really performed on the objects as such, only certain aspects thereof.
(2) A comparison is also indirect in its very essence; it can proceed only by means of some intermediary concepts, which should be relatable to the compared aspect(s) of both texts.
(3) These intermediary concepts should also be relatable to the theory in whose terms the comparison would be performed.\textsuperscript{47}

This type of analysis within these features will help the researchers to determine the coupled pairs and study them. These pairs will be useful for framing the regular patterns and it may pave the way for a descriptive, diachronic and target system-oriented theoretical framework rather than a normative and synchronic source system-oriented theoretical framework focusing translation process. The main objectives of this approach are to describe, explain and forecast the phenomena of translation. This translational phenomenon is only explained by its systematic role and position in the target culture.

4. Translation Procedure

In translation activity, the translator always found a problem in translating. One of problems is when the translator found a difficulty in translating the word from SL into TL. Then translator tried to finding the way out to solve the problem. In this case, the researcher uses translation procedure to resolve the problems. Translation procedures are used for sentence and the smaller units of language. The researcher uses thirteen translation procedures from Peter Newmark, there are:

**a. Transference**

Transference is the process of transferring a SL word to TL text as a translation procedure. It is same as Catford’s transference, and includes transliteration.\(^{48}\) It also same with borrowing that proposed by Vinay and Darbelnet. For instance, in order to introduce the flavor of the source language (SL) culture into a translation, foreign terms may be used.\(^{49}\) For example:

a. SL: Zaire, Malawi (English)  
TL: Zaire, Malawi (Indonesian)

b. SL: Coroner (English)  
TL: Koroner (Indonesian)

The example of transference translation or “borrowing” based on Newmark for the name of country “Zaire” and “Malawi” keep being translated as same as in the source language (SL) because that word includes to the name of geography. Another example of transference translation or known as ‘borrowing’ in the source language “coroner” into “koroner” in the target language, makes easier or better than to find out the other appropriate word in the target language (TL).

---

\(^{48}\) Peter Newmark, *op.cit.*, p. 81  
b. Naturalization

This procedure succeeds transference and adapts the SL word first to the normal pronunciations, then to the normal morphology (word-form) of the TL\textsuperscript{50} for example:

a. SL: Amputation (English)
   TL: *Amputasi* (Indonesian)

b. SL: Wingkel (Dutch)
   TL: *Bengkel* (Indonesian)

This procedure is done by absorbing the cultural word from the source language (SL) with adjusting the sound and spelling. This is done when the words is not found its equivalent in the target language (TL). For example, the terms of “amputation” and “wingkel” absorbing into “*amputasi*” and “*bengkel*”.

c. Cultural Equivalent

This is an approximate translation where a SL cultural word is translated by TL cultural word. It can be used in general texts, publicity and propaganda, as well as for brief explanation to the readers who-are ignorant of relevant SL culture.\textsuperscript{51}For example:

a. SL: “A” level exam (English)
   TL: *Ujian SPMB* (Indonesian)

---

\textsuperscript{50}Peter Newmark, *op.cit.*, p. 82

\textsuperscript{51}Ibid. p. 82-83
Example (a) is the name of test in English to entering a university meanwhile in Indonesian it called by SPMB in example (b).

d. Descriptive Equivalent

The translator cannot find a good translation or an equivalent in TL text, then because of it translator gives descriptive explanation to the word, phrase, sentence, etc in TL text.\(^{52}\) In translation, description sometimes has to be weighed against function. Thus for machete, the description is a “Latin American broad, heavy instrument’, the function is ‘cutting or aggression’. Description and function are essential elements in explanation and therefore in translation.\(^{53}\)

e. Synonymy

This procedure is used for a SL word where there is no clear one-to-one equivalent and the word is not important in the text, in particular for adjective or adverb of quality.\(^{54}\) For example:

SL: Jump from the frying pan into the fire. (English)

TL: Lepas dari mulut harimau masuk ke mulut buaya. (Indonesian)

f. Through Translation

The literal translation of common collocations, names of organizations, the components of compounds and perhaps phrases.\(^{55}\) This

\(^{52}\)Benny Hoedoro Hoed, Penerjemahan dan Kebudayaan (Jakarta: Pustaka Jaya, 2006) p. 74

\(^{53}\)Peter Newmark, op.cit., p. 83-84

\(^{54}\)Ibid, p. 84

\(^{55}\)Ibid. p. 84
procedure also called by Calque proposed by Vinay and Darbelnet. For example:

a. SL: Bulldozer (English)  
   TL: Buldoser (Indonesian)

b. SL: UNESCO (English)  
   TL: UNESCO (Indonesian)

The word “Bulldozer” from the source language (SL) is translated directly into target language (TL) without any changes or also can be written by using the italic style. For the second example, the word of UNESCO is translated directly because the word of UNESCO is the name of United Nation Organization that concern to education.

g. **Shift or Transposition**

   This procedure is replacing one word class with another without changing the meaning of the message. Transposition involves a change in grammar from the source language (SL) into target language (TL). The change can be a change of singular to plural, a change when specific SL structure does not exist in the TL, and a change of an SL verb to a TL noun. For example:

   SL: Road safety comes first (English)  
   TL: Utamakan keselamatan di jalan raya (Indonesian)

h. **Modulation**

   According to Vinay and Darbelnet, modulation is a variation of form of the message, obtained by a change in the point of view. This
change can be justified when, although a literal, or even transposed, translation results in a grammatically correct utterance, it is consider unsuitable, unidiomatic or awkward in the target language (TL). For example:

SL: The laws of Germany govern this agreement.
TL: Perjanjian ini diatur oleh hukum Jerman.

i. Recognized Translation
This procedure occurs when the translator normally use the official or generally accepted translation of any institutional term. For example:

SL: Input (English)
TL: Masukan (Common terms) or Asupan (Medical terms)

j. Translation Label
This is provisional translation, usually of a new institutional term, which should be made in inverted commas which can later be discreetly withdrawn. For example:

SL: IMF
TL: IMF, Dana Moneter Internasional

k. Compensation
This procedure occurs when loss of meaning, sound effect, metaphor or pragmatic effect in one part of sentence is compensated in another part, or in contiguous sentence. For example:

SL: A pair of socks (English)

---

56 Lawrence Venuti, *op.cit.*, p. 89
57 Peter Newmark, *op.cit.*, p. 89
58 *Ibid.* p. 90
59 *Ibid.* p. 90
TL: Sepasang kaos kaki (Indonesian)

1. Couplets

Couplets, triplets, quadruplets combine two, three, or four different procedures respectively for dealing with a single problem. They are particularly common for cultural words.\(^\text{60}\) For example:

SL: WHO encourages countries to continue strengthening influenza surveillance

TL: *WHO, Organisasi Kesehatan Dunia* menghimbau kepada setiap Negara untuk terus memperkuat pengawasannya terhadap virus flu.

m. Notes

Notes are additional information in translation. Additional information is regarded as an extra explanation of culture-specific concepts (Baker, 1992). According to Newmark (1988: 91), information added to the translation is normally cultural (accounting for the differences between SL and TL culture), technical (relating to the topic), or linguistic (explaining wayward use of words). The additional information may be put in the text (i.e. by putting it in brackets) or out of the text (i.e. by using a footnote). Such additional information is regarded as an extra explanation of culture-specific concepts (Baker, 1992) and is obligatory specification for comprehension purposes. Native speakers of Batak Tapanuli language (the native language of Batak community in North Sumatra), for example, have the word *marhusip* which literally means 'to whisper'. If the word *marhusip*

\(^{60}\text{Ibid. p.91}\)
is used in the context of discussing marriage within the community in question, its meaning is more than 'to whisper'. It refers specifically to a situation where family members of the bride meet family members of the groom to talk about the dowry. In the meeting, family members of the bride whisper with one another while deciding the amount of dowry they ask from the groom. Family members of the groom also do the same thing while deciding whether to accept or reject it. In this context, the word marhusip may be translated into 'to whisper', but additional information to clarify the meaning of marhusip is needed to help target readers understand its underlying concept. Addition of information for specification purposes is also required if ambiguity occurs in the receptor language information and if the fact that greater specificity may be required so as to avoid misleading reference (Nida, 1964: 227). This procedure is used when the translator supplies an explanation by giving additional information within the text at bottom of page, at the end of chapter or glossary at the end of the book.

1) Notes within text, includes:

a. As an alternative to the translated word: rendang-rendang, or dish made of beef cooked chili, numerous spices and coconut milk.

b. As an adjectival clause: selendang into selendang, which the scarf used by woman;

c. As a noun in apposition: pantheon; ancient temple
d. As a participial group (using present or past participle) for example: *dukun* into *dukun*, a man who mastering the magic;

e. In brackets, often for a literal translation of a transferred: *Minangkabau* into *Minangkabau* (an Indonesian ethnic) this way is similar with Duff solution above; however; he differentiates “notes within text in the brackets” into two kinds: a literal translation in brackets and an official or accepted translation;

f. In parantheses: *angklung* into an *angklung*-traditional musical instrument in Indonesia.

2) Notes at the bottom page.

3) Notes at the end of chapter

4) Notes or glossary at the end of book.\(^61\)

The explanation above can be concluded that there are some suggestions about supplying additional information in a translation or ‘Notes’. Any information can find in a reference book should not be used to replace any statement of the text but only supplement the text, where you think the readers are likely to find it inadequate, incomplete or obscure. Machali suggest this notion as *pemadanan bercatatan*, (equivalence by using notes); if the all procedures of translation cannot produce the expected equivalent, it can be done by equivalence by using notes. It applies when the

\(^{61}\text{Ibid. p. 91-92}\)
translation word and phrase that lexical equivalent is totally absence in the target language.

5. Cultural Words

According to Newmark, definition of culture is “the way of life of manifestations that are peculiar to a community that uses a particular language as its means of expressions.” Cultural words can be defined as a particular words living embodiment of how a group of people interact or communicate each other in a community and a given period of time which comprises ideas, values, assumptions, expectations, and plans of action.63

Therefore, the cultural words can be defined as a particular words living embodiment of how a group of people interact or communicate each other in a community and a given period of time which comprises ideas, values, assumptions, expectations, and plans of action.64

---

64 S. Pit Corder, Introducing Applied Linguistics (Great Britain: Hazell Watson 7 Viney, 1973), p. 68
customs, skill, arts, tools and so on. Peter Newmark also categorized the cultural words as follows:65


This type of terms includes geographical features that can be normally distinguished from other cultural terms which connected to social and material culture. Nevertheless, their diffusion depends on the importance of their country of origin as well as their degree of specificity. For technical texts, the Latin botanical and zoological classification can be used as an international language, e.g., ‘snail’. Many countries have ‘local’ words for plains like ‘savannah’ and ‘bush’ and these words exist with strong elements of local color.

5.2 Material Culture: Food, Clothes, Transport.

Material culture includes term used in daily life as a trend. Food terms are subject to the widest variety of translation procedure. Various setting: menus-straight, cookbooks, food guides, journalism increasingly contains foreign food terms.

For English, other food terms are in different category. Macaroni came over in 1600; spaghetti in 1880; many other Italian and Greek terms may have to be explained. Food terms has normally been transferred, only the French making continuous effort to naturalize it. Traditionally, upper class men’s clothes are English and women’s French (‘slip’, ‘bra’) but for the national costumes when distinctive are not translated, e.g. sari, kimono,

65 Newmark, Peter, (1988), op. cit, p. 95
‘jeans’ (which is an internationalism, and an American symbol like ‘coke’) clothes as cultural term may be sufficiently explained for TL general readers if the generic noun or classified is added: e.g., ‘shintigin trouser’ or basque skirt’, or again, if the particular is no interest, the generic word can simply replace it. However it has to be borne in mind that the function of the generic clothes term is approximately constant, indicating the part of body that is covered, but the description varies depending on climate and material used.

Transport is dominated by American a ‘car’, a ‘motorbike’, a sacred symbol in many countries of sacred private property. American and English has 25 words for the word of car. The system has spawned new features with their neologism: ‘lay bay’, roundabout’, ‘fly over’, interchange’ (echangeur). There are many vogue word produced not only by the innovator but also by the salesman talk. In fiction, the names of various carriage (caliche, cabriolet, ‘tillbury’, ‘landau’, ‘coupe’, ‘phaeton’) are often used to provide the local color and to the prestige; in the text book of transport, an accurate description has to be appended to the transferred word. Now, the names of planes and cars are often near-internationalisms for educated the readership such as ‘jumbo jet’, ‘ford’, ‘BMW’, ‘Volvo’, etc.66

5.3 Social Culture: Works and Leisure.

The terms are related to the social phenomena. The activities which are included the mass of people or one community usually afford such terms

---

66 Newmark, Peter, (1988), op.cit, p. 97
associated. The working class still has some political resonance in western Europe amongst the left, and even more so on in eastern Europe; thought it may disappear in the tertiary sector, ‘proletariat’ was always used mainly for its motive effect, and now can hardly be used seriously, since the majorities in developed countries are property owning. The obvious cultural words that denote leisure activities in Europe are the national games with their lexical sets: cricket, bull fighting, and hockey. To these must be added the largely English non team games: tennis, snooker, squash, badminton, and a large number of card games.\(^{67}\)

5.4 Social Organization: Political and Administrative, Religious and Artistic.

The political and social life of country is reflected in its institutional terms.\(^{68}\) This type of cultural categories includes such topics of customs, activities, procedures and concepts. The terms of institution and occupation can be different in any country. For example: the title of head of state ‘president’ can be ‘prime minister’ or ‘king’ in any other country. The same way could be happened in the name of parliament.

This type of cultural categories includes four specific typical terms such as: historical terms, international terms, regional terms, and artistic terms.\(^{69}\) Furthermore, the political and social life of a country is reflected in its institutional terms, in considering how the translator handles national the

\(^{67}\) Newmark, Peter, (1988), *op. cit.*, p. 98
\(^{68}\) Ibid, p. 99
\(^{69}\) Peter, Newmark, *op. cit.* pp. 101-102
institutional terms, the mass of modern political, financial, administrative, and social terms.\(^{70}\)

### 5.5 Gestures and Habits

For ‘gesture and habits’ there is a distinction between description and function which can be made where necessary in ambiguous cases: thus, spits as a blessing, kiss their fingertips to greet or praises, a slow hand-clap to express warm appreciation, give thumbs-up to signal OK, all of which occurs in some cultures and not in others.

Summarizing the translation of cultural words and institutional terms, I suggest that here, more than in any other translation problems, the most appropriate solution depends not so much on the collocation or the linguistic and situational context (though these have their place) as on the readership (of whom the three types-expert, educated generalist, and unformed-will usually require three different translation) and on the setting.\(^{71}\)

---

\(^{70}\) Ibid. p. 75

\(^{71}\) Ibid. p. 102
CHAPTER III
RESEARCH FINDING

A. Data Description of Cultural Words

In data description, the writer tabulates the selected data of cultural words which are taken from *Entrok* and *The Years of the Voiceless* including the types of cultural words and kinds procedure of notes that are used by the translator Nurhayat Indriyatno Mohamed. The selected data can be tabulated as follows.

*Table 1: The Data of Cultural Words, Their Classification, Source Language, Target Language, and the Type of Procedure of Note*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Source Language (SL)</th>
<th>Target Language (TL)</th>
<th>The Type of Cultural Words</th>
<th>The Type of Procedures of Notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Pecel. (Pages 28)</td>
<td>Pecel(^{13})</td>
<td>Material Culture: Food</td>
<td>Notes at the bottom of page</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(^{13})peanut and chili sauce (Pages 25)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Rujak. (Pages 131)</td>
<td>Rujak(^{25})</td>
<td>Material Culture: Food</td>
<td>Notes at the bottom of page</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(^{25})mixed fruit with a chili paste (Pages 124)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Rawon. (Pages 131)</td>
<td>Rawon(^{26})</td>
<td>Material Culture: Food</td>
<td>Notes at the bottom of page</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(^{26})beef stew (Pages 124)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Lodeh. (Pages 131)</td>
<td>Lodeh(^{27})</td>
<td>Material Culture: Food</td>
<td>Notes at the bottom of page</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(^{27})jackfruit stew (Pages 124)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Page</td>
<td>Item</td>
<td>Description</td>
<td>Category</td>
<td>Notes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td>-------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Ongko wolu.</td>
<td>Ongko wolu&lt;sup&gt;29&lt;/sup&gt; cassava donuts in the shape of a figure eight (Pages 261)</td>
<td>Material Culture: Food</td>
<td>Notes at the bottom of page</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Dawet.</td>
<td>Dawet&lt;sup&gt;10&lt;/sup&gt; rice flour jelly in palm sugar and coconut milk syrup (Pages 22)</td>
<td>Material Culture: Food</td>
<td>Notes at the bottom of page</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Ampyang.</td>
<td>Ampyang&lt;sup&gt;11&lt;/sup&gt; palm sugar cookies (Pages 22)</td>
<td>Material Culture: Food</td>
<td>Notes at the bottom of page</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Pincuk.</td>
<td>Pincuk&lt;sup&gt;12&lt;/sup&gt; rice snack wrapped in a banana leaf (Pages 23)</td>
<td>Material Culture: Food</td>
<td>Notes at the bottom of page</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Wayang kulit.</td>
<td>Wayang kulit&lt;sup&gt;24&lt;/sup&gt; shadow puppetry (Pages 115)</td>
<td>Social Culture: Leisure</td>
<td>Notes at the bottom of page</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Ketoprak.</td>
<td>Ketoprak&lt;sup&gt;18&lt;/sup&gt; a Javanese theatrical genre (Pages 86)</td>
<td>Social Culture: Leisure</td>
<td>Notes at the bottom of page</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Legi</td>
<td>Legi&lt;sup&gt;20&lt;/sup&gt; One of the days of the week in the Javanese calendar.</td>
<td>Social Organization: Custom</td>
<td>Notes at the bottom of page</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Considered auspicious if it falls on Friday. (Pages 87)</td>
<td>Pesugihan(^{23}) a ritual to seek wealth (Pages 114)</td>
<td>Social Organization: Custom</td>
<td>Notes at the bottom of page</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Pesugihan (Pages 121)</td>
<td>Pesugihan(^{23})</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>Kyai Noto. (Pages 102)</td>
<td>Kyai Noto(^{22})</td>
<td>Social Organization: Religious</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### B. The Data Analysis

From the tabulated data above that contains 13 cultural words which are chosen by consideration whether it is culture-specific item or not, the writer tries to classify and analyze the selected cultural words by using the relevant theories. The data can be analyzed as follows:

1. **Pecel**

SL: Yu Parti berjualan pecel dipasar ini sejak sebelum bertemu Pak Suyat. (p. 28)

TL: Yu Parti had been selling pecel\(^{13}\) at the market since before she met Mr. Suyat. (p. 25)

\(^{13}\)peanut and chili sauce

According to KBBI Dictionary pecel means as *makanan yang terdiri atas sayuran, seperti kacang panjang, bayam, taoge yang disiram dengan kuah sambal*.
Meanwhile, according to Kamus Lengkap Jawa-Indonesia *pecel* means as *lauk (sayuran yang dicampur dengan sambal kacang)*. In English, there is a similar food like *salad*, but it is not served by peanut sauce. According to Oxford dictionary, *salad* is a *dish made by the combination of vegetable (tomato, carrot, lettuce and mayonnaise)*. Based on this explanation, the writer considers that *pecel* and *salad* have different concept or ingredients. *Pecel* consists of vegetable such as spinach, long bean, bean sprout, and be flavored by peanut sauce. That is why; *pecel* is translated with giving additional information by using a footnote at the bottom of the page.

On the other hand, the writer also considers that *pecel* is translated by giving a footnote at the bottom of the page, because the TL does not have any equivalent concept with SL. Besides, the writer also considers that the translator wants to give a local color for the target reader in the TL. The picture below shows the differences between *pecel* and *salad*:

In this point, the writer considers that the additional information of *pecel* in the bottom of page as *peanut and chili sauce* is not equivalence in the TL. It is not equivalence in the TL, because the message of it does not complete the

---

1. KBBI Online Dictionary accessed on February, 20th
naturalness in the TL. The translator also does not change the concept of *pecel* into *peanut and chili sauce* and prefer to keep the original meaning of it in the TL. The writer considers that the additional information in the footnote should be added into “boiled assorted vegetables with the peanut and chili sauce” in order to make this translation more equivalences.

The writer considers that this additional information does not equivalence enough, because the original concept of *pecel* based on the explanation above is “boiled assorted vegetables with the peanut and chili sauce”.

If it is only translated into *peanut and chili sauce*, the message will not be delivered well to the target reader in the TL. Because, the target reader only know the concept about *peanut and chili sauce* without knowing *boiled assorted vegetables with the peanut and chili sauce*. Therefore, the writer considers that the additional information in the footnote should be added into “boiled assorted vegetables with the peanut and chili sauce” in order to make this translation more equivalences.

2. **Rujak**


(p. 131)

TL: I prepared all kinds of food for her. Pecel, *rujak*, rawon, lodeh. \(^{25}\)

(p. 124)

\(^{25}\) mixed fruits with a chili paste
According to Kamus Lengkap Jawa-Indonesia rujak means as makanan yang terbuat dari buah-buahan mentah. Meanwhile, according to KBBI Dictionary rujak means as makanan yang dibuat dari buah-buahan, kadang-kadang disertai sayuran yang diiris kemudian diberi bumbu yang terdiri atas asam, gula, cabai, dan lain-lain. In English, the writer found that there is a similar food like rujak. It is known as fruit salad. But, the concept between rujak and salad is different each other. According to Oxford dictionary, fruit salad is a mixture of different types of chopped fruit served in syrup or juice. Nowadays, the fruit salad is also served with adding mayonnaise and vanilla instant pudding. Based on this explanation, the writer considers that rujak and fruit salad have different concept or ingredients. Rujak consists of mixture of different types of chopped fruits and be served with peanut sauce.

Meanwhile, fruit salad is served by syrup, juice, mayonnaise, vanilla instant pudding, etc. That is why; rujak is translated by giving additional information by using a footnote in the bottom of page. On the other hand, the writer also considers that rujak is translated by giving a footnote, because the TL readers may not know the concept of rujak, such as the color, shape and ingredients. Besides, the writer also considers that the translator wants to give a local color for the target reader in the TL. Therefore, the translator gives additional information for it.

---

4 Sutrisno Sastro Utomo, op.cit., p. 406  
5 KBBI Online Dictionary, accesses on 20 February  
In this point, the writer considers that the additional information of *rujak* in the bottom of page as *mixed fruit with chili sauce* is not equivalence in the TL. It is not equivalence in the TL, because the message of it does not complete the naturalness in the TL. The translator also does not change the concept of *rujak* into *fruit salad* and prefer to keep the original meaning of it in the TL. The writer considers that the additional information in the footnote should be added into “*mixed tropical fruits with a chili paste*” in order to make this translation more equivalences.

3. Rawon


TL: I prepared all kinds of food for her. Pecel, rujak, *rawon*, lodeh.\(^{26}\) (p. 124)

\(^{26}\)beef stew

According to KBBI dictionary, *rawon* means as *masakan berkuah yang dibuat dari irisan daging dengan bumbu utama keluak ditambah dengan rempah-rempah lainnya*. In English, the writer found that there is a similar food like *rawon*. It is known as *stew*. But, the concept between *rawon* and *stew* is different each other. According to Oxford dictionary, *stew* is *a dish of meat and vegetables cooked slowly in liquid in a container that has a lid*. Based on this explanation,
the writer considers that *rawon* and *stew* have different concept or ingredients. *Rawon* consists of meat that sliced into dice cooked with the traditional spices known as *keluak* which is as primary ingredient to make the color of the sauce became into black.

Meanwhile, *stew* is like a soup consisting of meat and vegetable and the color of the sauce is brighter than *rawon*. That is why; *rawon* is translated by giving additional information by using a footnote in the bottom of page. On the other hand, the writer also considers that *rawon* is translated by giving a footnote in the bottom of page, because the TL does not have any equivalent concept with *rawon* in SL. Besides, the writer also considers that the translator wants to give a local color for the target reader in the TL.

**Picture 4**

In this point, the writer considers that the additional information of *rawon* in the bottom of page as *beef stew* is not equivalence in the TL. It is not equivalence in the TL, because the message of it does not complete the naturalness in the TL. The translator also does not change the concept of *rawon* into *beef stew* and prefer to keep the original meaning of it in the TL. The writer considers that the additional information in the footnote should be added into “*beef cooked in the black soup*” in order to make this translation more equivalences.
However, the writer also considers that the additional information by applying notes in the bottom of page procedure to translate rawon in the TL does not specific enough. It does not specific enough; because the concept between rawon and its translation beef stew has many differences. Therefore, the writer considers that rawon will be more equivalence if it is added by the information into “beef cooked in the black soup” in order to keep the original meaning of it in the TL.

4. Lodeh

(p. 131)  

TL: I prepared all kinds of food for her. Pecel, rujak, rawon, lodeh\textsuperscript{27}. (p. 124)  
\footnote{27}jackfruit stew

According to KBBI dictionary, lodeh means as sayur bersantan yang dibuat dari berbagai sayuran seperti terung, kacang panjang, kol, dan cabai. Meanwhile, according to Kamus Lengkap Jawa-Indonesia lodeh means as jenis makanan (sayur). In English, the writer cannot found that a similar food like lodeh. That is why; lodeh is translated by giving additional information by using a footnote in the bottom of page. On the other hand, the writer also considers that lodeh is translated by giving a footnote, because the TL does not have any equivalent concept with lodeh in SL. Besides, the writer also considers that the translator wants to give a local color for the target reader in the TL. Therefore, the translator gives additional information for it.
In this point, the writer considers that the additional information of *lodeh* in the bottom of page as *jackfruit stew* is not equivalence in the TL. It is not equivalence in the TL, because the message of it does not complete the naturalness in the TL. The translator also does not change the concept of *lodeh* into *jackfruit syew* and prefer to keep the original meaning of it in the TL. The writer considers that the additional information in the footnote should be added into “*vegetable soup in coconut milk*” in order to make this translation more equivalences.

However, the writer considers that this translation does not equivalence enough to translate *lodeh*. The writer considers that it will be more equivalence if it is added the information into “*Vegetable soup in coconut milk*” in the bottom of page in order to keep the original meaning of it in the TL.

5. Ongko Wolu

SL: Dua orang lainnya membuat ampyang, *ongko wolu*, dan roti. (p. 279)

TL: The two others would make ampyang, *ongko wolu*, and bread. (p. 261)

---

*cassava donuts in the shape of a figure eight*

According to KBBI dictionary, *ongko wolu* means as *cemilan yang terbuat dari singkong parut yang dibentuk menyerupai bentuk angka delapan dan*
digoreng. Ongko wolu is kind of snack which commonly known in Javanese. The name of it is derived from the shape of it which similar with eight number. In Javanese language the number of eight called by wolu and the pronounced of number or angka is ongko. In English, the writer cannot found the similar food like ongko wolu. That is why; ongko wolu is translated by giving additional information by using footnotes in the bottom of page to avoid the confusion of the reader in understand the concept of ongko wolu. On the other hand, the writer also considers that ongko wolu is translated by giving a footnote in the bottom of page because the TL does not have any equivalent concept with ongko wolu in SL. Besides, the writer also considers that the translator wants to give a local color for the target reader in the TL. Therefore, the translator gives additional information for it.

**Picture 6**

Considering the result, the writer considers that the additional information of ongko wolu in the bottom of page as cassava donuts in the shape of a figure eight is not equivalence in the TL. It is not equivalence in the TL, because the message of it does not complete the naturalness in the TL.

However, the writer considers that this additional information or the message of ongko wolu in the TL does not equivalence enough to describe the original concept of it in the SL. The additional information in the TL describe that
ongko wolu is cassava donuts in the shape of a figure eight. But, the writer considers that the additional information based on the explanation above is “snack which is made from cassava in the shape of eight and fried”. If it is translated into cassava donuts, the concept of ongko wolu will be understood as donut by the target readers in TL not as traditional snack. Therefore, the writer considers that the additional information in the footnote should be changed into “cassava snack in the shape of a figure eight” in order to have more equivalence translation.

6. Ampyang

SL: Anak perempuannya berjualan ditengah pasar, bersebelahan dengan penjual dawet dan ampyang. (p. 25)

TL: Her daughter stall was in the center of the market, next to a stall selling dawet and ampyang. (p. 22)

\(^{11}\)palm sugar cookies

According to Kamus Lengkap Jawa-Indonesia ampyang means nama makanan dari kacang yang dicampur gula merah. That is why; ampyang is translated by giving additional information by using a footnote in the bottom of page. On the other hand, the writer also considers that ampyang is translated by giving a footnote, because the TL does not have any equivalent concept with ampyang in SL. Besides, the writer also considers that the translator wants to give a local color for the target reader in the TL. Therefore, the translator gives additional information for it.
In this point, the writer considers that the additional information of *ampyang* in the bottom of page as *palm sugar cookies* is not equivalence in the TL. It is not equivalence in the TL, because the message of it does not complete the naturalness in the TL. The translator also does not change the concept of *ampyang* into *palm sugar cookies* and prefer to keep the original meaning of it in the TL. The writer considers that the additional information in the footnote should be added into “*palm sugar peanut snack*” in order to make this translation more equivalence.

However, the writer considers that this translation does not equivalence enough to translate *ampyang*. It is because, the additional information or the message of *ampyang* in the TL has different concept with cookies that has been explained in the footnote. According to Oxford online dictionary explain that *cookies* is *a sweet biscuit*. Meanwhile, *ampyang* in the SL is known as *snack*. Based on this explanation, the writer considers that the translations need to add or change into “*palm sugar peanut snack*” in order to make this translation more equivalence.
7. Dawet

SL: Anak perempuannya berjualan ditengah pasar, bersebelahan dengan penjual *dawet* dan ampyang. (p. 25)

TL: Her daughter stall was in the center of the market, next to a stall selling *dawet*\(^{10}\) and ampyang. (p. 22)

\(^{10}\) *rice flour jelly in palm sugar and coconut milk syrup*

According to KBBI dictionary, *dawet* means as *minuman berupa campuran air gula, santan, dan cendol*. In English, the writer does not found the similar drink like *dawet*. That is why; *dawet* is translated by giving additional information by using a footnote in the bottom of page. On the other hand, the writer also considers that *dawet* is translated by giving a footnote, because the TL does not have any equivalent concept with *dawet* in SL. Besides, the writer also considers that the translator wants to give a local color for the target reader in the TL. Therefore, the translator gives additional information for it.

**Picture 7**

Considering the translation result, the writer considers that this translation is equivalence in the TL. The writer considers it is equivalence in the TL, because the translator tries to give a complete naturalness about *dawet* into *rice flour jelly*
in palm sugar and coconut milk syrup. Besides, the writer considers that this translation is equivalence enough to explain about dawet, because the additional information or the message of dawet in the TL has been described the original concept of it in the SL. Therefore, the writer considers that the translation does not need to add or change into another translation.

8. Pincuk

SL: Akhirnya aku tahu yang berteriak adalah Yu Parti, penjual pecel *pincuk*.

(p. 26)

TL: I finally figured out that it was Yu Parti, the *pincuk* vendor, who was yelling. (p. 23)

---

12 rice snack wrapped in a banana leaf

According to KBBI dictionary, *pincuk* means *wadah yang terbuat dari daun pisang yang dilipat dan disemat dengan menggunakan lidi sehingga membentuk lekukan*. Meanwhile, according to Kamus Jawa-Indonesia dictionary, *pincuk* means *tempat makan yang terbuat dari daun pisang*. In English; the writer cannot found that there is a similar food like *pincuk*. That is why; *pincuk* is translated by giving additional information by using a footnote in the bottom of page. On the other hand, the writer also considers that *pincuk* is translated by giving a footnote, because the TL does not have any equivalent concept with *pincuk* in SL. Besides, the writer also considers that the translator wants to give a local color for the target reader in the TL. Therefore, the translator gives additional information for it.
Considering the translation result, the writer considers that this translation is equivalence in the TL. The writer considers it is equivalence in the TL, because the translator tries to give a complete naturalness about \textit{pincuk} into \textit{rice snack wrapped in banana leaf}. Besides, the writer considers that this translation is equivalence enough to explain about \textit{pincuk}, because the additional information or the message of \textit{pincuk} in the TL has been described the original concept of it in the SL. Therefore, the writer considers that the translation does not need to add or change into another translation.

9. \textbf{Wayang Kulit}

SL: Bedanya kalau dulu hanya gambyong, sekarang ditambah \textit{wayang kulit}. (p. 122)

TL: The difference was that before there was just dancing, but this time there was also a \textit{wayang kulit}\textsuperscript{24} show. (p. 115)

\textsuperscript{24}shadow puppetry
According to KBBI dictionary, *wayang kulit* means as *boneka tiruan orang yang terbuat dari pahatan kayu atau kulit yang dapat dimanfaatkan untuk memerankan tokoh dalam pertunjukan drama tradisional, biasanya dimainkan oleh seseorang yang disebut dalang*. In English, the writer found that there is a similar food like *wayang kulit*. That is why; *wayang kulit* is translated by giving additional information by using a footnote in the bottom of page. On the other hand, the writer also considers that *wayang kulit* is translated by giving a footnote, because the TL does not have any equivalent concept with *wayang kulit* in SL. Besides, the writer also considers that the translator wants to give a local color for the target reader in the TL. Therefore, the translator gives additional information for it.

**Picture 10**

Considering the translation result, the writer considers that this translation is equivalence in the TL. The writer considers it is equivalence in the TL, because the translator tries to give a complete naturalness about *wayang kulit* into *shadow puppetry*. Besides, the writer considers that this translation is equivalence enough to explain about *wayang kulit*, because the additional information or the message of *wayang kulit* in the TL has been described the original concept of it in the SL.
Therefore, the writer considers that the translation does not need to add or change into another translation.

10. Ketoprak

SL: Mereka mulai membahas segalanya mulai dari *ketoprak* sampai penyanyi dangdut. (p. 92)

TL: They spoke about everything from *ketoprak*\(^\text{18}\) to dangdut singers. (p. 86)

\(^{18}\text{Javanese theatrical genre}\)

According to KBBI dictionary, *ketoprak* means as *sandiwara tradisional Jawa*, biasanya memainkan cerita lama dengan diiringi music gamelan, disertai dengan tarian dan tembang. The writer considers that *ketoprak* is translated by giving a footnote, because the TL does not have any equivalent concept with *ketoprak* in SL. That is why; *ketoprak* is translated by giving additional information by using a footnote in the bottom of page. On the other hand, the writer also considers that the translator wants to give a local color for the target reader in the TL. Therefore, the translator gives additional information for it.

Picture 11

Considering the translation result, the writer considers that this translation is equivalence in the TL. The writer considers it is equivalence in the TL, because the translator tries to give a complete naturalness about *ketoprak* into *Javanese theatrical genre*. Besides, the writer considers that this translation is equivalence
enough to explain about ketoprak, because the additional information or the message of ketoprak in the TL has been described the original concept of it in the SL. Therefore, the writer considers that the translation does not need to add or change into another translation.

11. Legi

SL: Koh Cayadi menawari ibu untuk ikut dalam ziarahnya pada Jumat Legi yang jatuh minggu depan. (p. 93)

TL: Koh Cayadi offered to take mother on his next pilgrimage there on the next Legi\textsuperscript{20} Friday, which was next week. (p. 87)

\footnotesize\textsuperscript{20}One of the days of the week in Javanese calendar. Consider auspicious if it falls on Friday.

According to KBBI dictionary, Legi means as hari pasaran yang kedua. In English, the writer cannot found the similar thing like legi. That is why; legi is translated by giving additional information by using a footnote in the bottom of page. On the other hand, the writer also considers that legi is translated by giving a footnote, because the TL does not have any equivalent concept with legi in SL. Besides, the writer also considers that the translator wants to give a local color for the target reader in the TL. Therefore, the translator gives additional information for it.

Considering the translation result, the writer considers that this translation is equivalence in the TL. The writer considers it is equivalence in the TL, because the translator tries to give a complete naturalness about Legi into One of the days of the week in Javanese calendar. Consider auspicious if it falls on Friday.
Besides, the writer considers that this translation is equivalence enough to explain about *Legi*, because the additional information or the message of *Legi* in the TL has been described the original concept of it in the SL. Therefore, the writer considers that the translation does not need to add or change into another translation.

In this point, the writer considers that this translation is equivalence in the TL, because the additional information or the message of *legi* in the TL has equivalence enough to describe the original concept of it in the SL. The writer considers that the additional information in the footnote has clear to explain the original concept of *legi* for the target reader in the TL. Therefore, the writer considers that the translation does not need to add or change into another translation.

12. Pesugihan

SL: Bejo jadi sajen. Sajen *pesugihan*. (p. 121)

TL: Bejo was an offering. An offering for a *pesugihan*\(^{23}\). (p. 114)

\(^{23}\) *a ritual to seek wealth*

According to KBBI dictionary, *pesugihan* means as *ritual untuk mencari kekayaan*. The word of *pesugihan* is comes from the base word in the Javanese language that is *sugih* which means rich or prosperous. In English, there is no belief about this activities, because of the religion of Indonesian people were Buddhism and Hinduism is also influenced the culture especially in the Javanese. Meanwhile, according to Kamus Lengkap Jawa-Indonesia dictionary *pesugihan*
means *azimat agar bisa kaya.*\(^7\) *Azimat* in Indonesian language means spell. In practice *pesugihan* is associated with the activities carried out by the use of spells. That is why; *pesugihan* is translated by giving additional information by using a footnote in the bottom of page. On the other hand, the writer also considers that *pesugihan* is translated by giving a footnote, because the TL does not have any equivalent concept with *pesugihan* in SL. Besides, the writer also considers that the translator wants to give a local color for the target reader in the TL and as the responsibility for the reader to explained more detail and clearly. Therefore, the translator gives additional information for it.

Considering the translation result, the writer considers that this translation is equivalence in the TL. The writer considers it is equivalence in the TL, because the translator tries to give a complete naturalness about *pesugihan* into *a ritual to seek wealth.* Besides, the writer considers that this translation is equivalence enough to explain about *pesugihan*, because the additional information or the message of *pesugihan* in the TL has been described the original concept of it in the SL. Therefore, the writer considers that the translation does not need to add or change into another translation.

\(^7\) Sutrisno Sastro Utomo, *op.cit.*, p. 439
13. Kyai

SL: Setiap orang butuh gula. Untuk masak, minum, atau untuk orang seperti Kyai Noto yang memberikan obat pada orang sakit melalui sejumput gula. (p. 102)

TL: Everyone needed a sugar. For cooking, for drinking, or, for people like Kyai\textsuperscript{22} Noto, to help sick people take their medicine. (p. 95)

\textsuperscript{22}Tittle for a prominent Islamic cleric

According to KBBI dictionary, kyai means as sebutan bagi alim ulama (cerdik atau pandai dalam agama Islam). The absence of this word in the target language becomes a reason that is why; kyai is translated by giving additional information by using a footnote in the bottom of page. On the other hand, the writer also considers that kyai is translated by giving a footnote, because the TL does not have any equivalent concept with kyai in SL. Besides, the writer also considers that the translator wants to give a local color for the target reader in the TL. Therefore, the translator gives additional information for it.

Considering the translation result, the writer considers that this translation is equivalence in the TL. The writer considers it is equivalence in the TL, because the translator tries to give a complete naturalness about Kyai into Tittle for a prominent Islamic cleric. Besides, the writer considers that this translation is equivalence enough to explain about Kyai, because the additional information or the message of Kyai in the TL has been described the original concept of it in the SL. Therefore, the writer considers that the translation does not need to add or change into another translation.
In this point, the writer considers that this translation is equivalence in the TL, because the additional information or the message of *kyai* in the TL has equivalence enough to describe the original concept of it in the SL. The writer considers that the additional information in the footnote has clear to explain the original concept of *kyai* for the target reader in the TL. Therefore, the writer considers that the translation does not need to add or change into another translation.
CHAPTER IV

CONCLUSION AND SUGGESTION

A. Conclusion

In the novel The Years of The Voiceless there are 13 cultural words which translated using translation procedure of notes. From 13 data, the writer summarize 13 data that indicate not equivalent. After analyzing the data, the writer would like to draw some conclusion about his research. From the thirteen selected data, it can be concluded thirteen data is translated using the procedure of notes at the bottom of page. Through this analysis, the result showed that from 13 cultural words, there were 7 cultural words which have its equivalency in the TL such as dawet, pincuk, wayang kulit, ketoprak, legi, pesugihan and kyai. Meanwhile, there were 6 cultural words which did not have any equivalency such as rujak, pecel, rawon, lodeh, ongko wolu, and ampyang. It did not show any equivalency in the TL, because the translation of them could not give a complete message for the target readers in the TL. This research also revealed that the using of the translation procedure of notes at the bottom of the page could not always give a complete naturalness in the TL.

B. Suggestion

The suggestion is given for the translator of novel, the student of translation major, and all people who do something related to the translation activities. Even though it is possible for the translator to translate the cultural word in detail from SL into TL, this matter will reduce the efficiency of the
language which is used. Because the translator translate cultural work, it will be better if the translator use translation procedure of notes to get accurate translation. The culture between the SL and TL both of languages are different; it will cause misunderstanding in comprehension. By the translation procedure of notes, it will help the reader to be easier in understanding the words.

The translator must be attention in using the notes. Translating the cultural words, the translator should know and understand well about the term in SL and TL. The translator should have the broad knowledge about the component of the SL words in detail before translating it into TL. A good understanding about SL words will cause an accurate translation because the translator can translate the word of SL with the right additional information in TL which able to visualize the right thing to the reader. The writer hopes that this paper will enrich the reader understanding the translation procedure of notes.
BIBLIOGRAPHY

Books:


----------. *Translation Studies. an Integrated Approach*. Amsterdam: John Benjamins, 1988


**Journals:**


Tezcan, Tuncay. *Applicability of Translation Criticism Approaches to Different Text Types,* Ankara: Hacettepe University Graduate School of Social Sciences, 2015.
APPENDICES

The Synopsis of Entrok

Marni is an illiterate Javanese woman who still practices ancestor worship. Through her offerings she finds her gods and puts forth her hopes. She knows nothing of the god brought in from that faraway land.

Rahayu is Marni’s daughter, part of new generation shaped by education and an easier life. She is a firm believer in God and in common sense. She stands against the ancestors, even against her own mother.

To Marni, Rahayu is soulless being. And to Rahayu, Marni is sinner. Each lives according to her own creed, with nothing in common.

Then come the sounds of jackboots, constantly disrupting and destroying souls. They are the one with authority, the one who play with power as they desire. They are the one who can turn the skies and the field red, and blood yellow, their guns ready to strike anywhere.

Marni and Rahayu, these women from two generations who have never understood each other, finally find something in their lives that they agree on. Both are victims of those in power. Both fight against guns.
About the Author

Okky was born on October 30, 1984 in Magetan, East Java, Indonesia. She graduated from Gadjah Mada University’s International Relations Department in 2005 with bachelor's degree in Political Science. She has chosen to become a journalist and writer ever since her graduation. In 2012, she took sociology for her master's degree from the University of Indonesia, and graduated in July 2014. Her first novel *Entrok*, an epic about life under totalitarian and militarism during the Indonesia's New Order era, has been translated into English and was published in July 2013 under the title of *The Years of the Voiceless*. Her two other novels, *Maryam* and *Pasung Jiwa*, have also been translated into English under the title of *The Outcast* and *Bound* respectively. *Pasung Jiwa* also has been translated in German under the title *Gebunden* in 2015.

Okky’s novels consistently voice human rights and freedom, and are always against any form of repression. Okky is a realist, with all of her novels attempting to portray the face of Indonesia. While she tells mostly about Indonesia and its people, the issues she carries in her novels showcase basic and universal humankind's problems. Okky’s first novel, *Entrok* (2010), tells a story about how Indonesians live under the ruthless dictatorship of Suharto's regime and how they struggled to survive under oppression of the military's dominance. Her second novel 86 (2011) vividly describes the prevalent corruption within the country and especially among its civil servants. The novel was shortlisted as top five in the Khatulistiwa Literary Award in 2011. Her third novel *Maryam* (2012) which describes how Ahmadis are violently thrown away from their own home and homeland without any protection from the government won the 2012 Khatulistiwa Literary Award. The novel has been translated into English under the title of *The Outcast* in March 2014.

*Pasung Jiwa* is her fourth novel, released in May 2013. It addresses individual struggle to break free from his or her individual limitation as well as the containment of norm, tradition, religion, state and economic dominance of the few rich. The novel was shortlisted by the Khatulistiwa Literary Award in 2013. *Pasung Jiwa* has also been translated into English under the title of *Bound* in July 2014 and translated into German under the title *Gebunden*.

Her fifth novel, *Kerumunan Terakhir*, was published in May 2016. In this novel Okky tries to capture how digital phenomena and social media take over people's lives, with new generation confusing reality with virtual activities.
About the Translator

Nurhayat Indriyatno Mohammed is the managing editor of the Jakarta Globe, an English-language newspaper in Jakarta. He was born and raised in Tanzania, and has a degree in mechanical engineering from the University of Natal, Durban, in South Africa. At age 24 Hayat decided to move to Indonesia, the land of his father’s birth, and was immediately smitten by the novelty of it all. A chance encounter led to a newspaper job, and another presented him with the opportunity to translate into English a book by the award-winning author Okky Madasari. Hayat also is the translator of Erni Aladjai’s award winning novel entitled Kei.
Lapak mereka berjauhan. Kelas orang miskin dari pintu depan pasar, lapak Nyai Dimah yang akan dipajari. Sementara lapak masuk dari belakang, yang berbatas langsung dengan sungai, akan langsung bertemu penjual gaplek laki-laki, yang tak lain anak pertama Nyai Dimah. Anak perempuannya berjualan di tengah pasar, bersebelahan dengan penjual slawer dan kue yang.


Setiap hari aku ke pasar bersama Simbok. Rasanya ini jadi lebih menyenangkan daripada aku diam dalam rumah, menunggu Simbok sambil bermain bersama Tinah, lalu memasak saat Simbok pulang. Di pasar, aku bisa kenal lebih banyak orang, melihat berbagai kejadian yang kadang bisa membahagiakan, sedih, atau peristiwa yang lewat begitu saja.


Aku, yang bermutu paling kecil di antara orang-orang itu, menghitung dari sela-sela pinggir orang-orang yang ada di depanku. Akhirnya aku tahu yang terbaik adalah Yu Parti. extraordinary compared to our house with its worn bamboo walls and palm-thatched roof.

Two of Mrs. Dimahi’s children also sold cassava slawers at this market. Their stalls were spread apart. From the main entrance it was Mrs. Dimahi’s stall that people would see first. From the rear entrance, right by the river’s edge, the first cassava slawer vendor people would encounter was Mrs. Dimahi’s son. Her daughter’s stall was in the center of the market, next to a stall selling draswell and simbang.

Over the next few days, Mrs. Dimahi practically became our permanent employer. Everyday she always had cassava for us to peel. And I don’t know why there was never anyone else to peel them before we got there. In fact, the other cassava chip vendors we went to turned us away because they had already had their cassavas peeled and cut earlier in the day and were out of cassavas. At Mrs. Dimahi’s stall, it seemed, she reserved the work just for us.

Every day I went to the market with Simbok. It was more fun than just staying at home and playing with Tinah while waiting for Simbok to return so that I could cook. At the market, I could meet more people and see things that would make me laugh or sad, or things that just came and went.

Like today, for instance. A woman could be heard screaming in the chili and onion section of the market. Simbok and I stopped what we were doing and stood up to look. The vendors around Mrs. Dimahi’s stall began moving forward to the sound of the shouting. So did the people who...


Teriakan dan makanan kacau keluar dari mulut kedua perempuan itu.


---

were shopping. Simbok and I joined the crowd looking for the source of the shouting.

Being the smallest person there, I had to peek between the mass of bodies in front of me. I finally figured out that it was Yu Party, the pepper vendor, who was yelling. Her left hand was on her hip and her right was stabbing in the direction of Yu Yem, the red chili vendor. Yu Yem, standing at her stall, looked a bit frightened.

"Everybody, Iyem here is a whore. She’s a husband stealer," Yu Party yelled in anger.

Yu Yem appeared to take offense at that and grew angry herself. She answered in just as high a tone. "Don’t call me whore. You’re the one that can’t take care of your husband. It’s not my fault that he wants to marry me."

"You whore, you husband stealer," Yu Party was really getting steamed now. She moved closer to Yu Yem’s stall, and with a sweep of her arm sent the chili peppers scattering everywhere.

Seeing her goads thrown about sent Yu Yem over the edge. She yanked at Yu Party’s hair. Yu Party screamed again, this time out of pain. She raged at Yu Yem’s hair. The two women were now clawing at each other. A volley of screams and curses was traded.

None of the people watching did anything. They only called for them to stop, but didn’t actually try to break up the fight between the two market vendors. Mrs. Dimah, for instance, who was considered one of the market elders, was only shouting for Yu Party and Yu Yem to stop fighting.

"Good heavens! Stop it, Yu. That’s enough. Calm down!"
selling at the market, they were free people without a care in the world.

Yu Parti and Yu Yem seemed to have forgotten that they shared a husband. It was as though Yu Parti couldn’t remember that she used to lay sole claim to this man, and now he belonged to someone else too. And Yu Yem didn’t seem to care that she had been publicly accused of being a whore and a husband stealer. Although they never spoke to one another after the fight, in the market they both went on with their respective lives with the same zest as before, still driven by the desire to make as much money as possible. Here, they were their own people, not defined by whether or not they had a man.

From the gossip going around the market, particularly coming from Mrs. Dimah, I learned that Mr. Suyat had indeed just recently married Yu Yem. And it wasn’t like he was young anymore. He and Yu Parti already had four children who were all married. Yu Yem herself was about the same age as their eldest child.

Yu Parti had been selling pekak at the market since before she met Mr. Suyat. They met when he was working as a porter here. After they got married, Mr. Suyat stopped working and started helping her sell the food by looking for the leaves for the pincuk and making coffee for the customers. The food was the source of their income.

People began getting suspicious about Mr. Suyat after Yu Yem started working at the market. He would often come to her stall, at first just to buy chili, but later spend the whole day sitting there.
anak buah Koh Cayadi, pembeli televisi akan mendapat pelayanan langsung dari pemilik toko. Koh Cayadi yang pandai bicara mengajak tamunya ngobrol tentang banyak hal, bertanya tentang pekerjaan, dengan harapan suka tahu ada celah yang bisa menghasilkan duit dengan kenaian barangnya itu.

Dengan ibu, pembicaraan dialurr dengan acara televisi yang menarik perhatiannya. Ibunya yang juga sedang kena demam televisi menanggapinya dengan penuh semangat. Mulai dari ke-

belakang sampai penyangut daging mereka bahas. Lalu mereka membicarakan urusan yang lebih kecil, tentang pekerjaan mereka sehari-hari. Saat inilah Koh Cayadi menceritakan asal-usul kelahirannya dan kepedinasannya ke Madura dari Surabaya.

Ibu juga menceritakan apa yang dilalukannya. Berawal dari dagang sayur, perkakas, sampai sekarang dagang duit. Sebagai sesama pedagang, mereka seperti menemukan kesenangan dan langgung skarab.


[footnote: a Japanese theatrical genre]
[footnote: a romantic and Arabic inspired musical genre]


87

and her loan business. As fellow traders, they seemed to enjoy one another's company and became very friendly.

Koh Cayadi told us about one of his family’s customs that he believed had helped keep business running smoothly. For several years, since he was still a child in Surabaya, his parents would take him routinely to Mount Kawi in Malang, a town just south of Surabaya. They would go by bus, and the journey would take two hours. At the mountain there was a grave, and it was said that whoever made a pilgrimage to it would be blessed.

Mother listened with rapt attention. She strongly believed that spiritual help was necessary if one was to truly prosper and be successful. All she had ever known was ancestor worship. Her spiritual efforts were limited to her nighttime prayers, taking food offerings to the graves of the village guardians, and giving thanks on her name days.

Now she had learned about a mountain to the east that could bestow wealth on those who visited it. And she could see for herself how well Koh Cayadi seemed to be doing selling expensive items from his large store.

Koh Cayadi offered to take Mother on his next pilgrimage there on the next *Lepi* Friday, which was next week. She immediately accepted. They were now fast friends who trusted one another.

Koh Cayadi had one of his staff come with us to Singget to set up the new TV, plug it into the electrical outlet and set up the antenna so that we would get the clearest pictures. He

87

One of the days of the week in the Javanese calendar. Considered auspicious if it falls on a Friday.

Pabrik membeli tebu dengan harga 440.000 per ton. Hari itu, setelah dihitung, ada tiga puluh ton tebu yang diterima dari sawahku. Mandor pabrik menyerahkan tangg 13.200.000 padaku.


Life was not as hard as mine. I also shared my fortune with the soldiers and paid my dues to the neighborhood unit chief and the ward chief, even the party. I also donated whenever the mosque needed repairs or when a new prayer hall was being built. And yet they still hated me.

Even so, they asked me to donate for the campaign again. They wanted 250,000. They said it was for renting a stage again, like five years ago. Fortunately, life wasn’t as hard as it was five years ago. I could get the money not just from collecting on the debts, but also from the sale of my sugarcane to the Purwadadi Sugar Factory. The sugarcane harvest began yesterday. They sent trucks from the sugar factory to pick up all the sugarcane harvested in the sub-district, including mine.

Because of the harvest, I didn’t go to the market. I could collect the borrowers’ installments the next day. I needed to supervise the people cutting down the sugarcane, as well as get my payment from the factory. Foreman once all the sugarcane had been trucked away.

Fifteen people, all men, would be cutting down my half hec of sugarcane. They were going to be dozens more on the field next to mine. That was the ward chief’s sugarcane. He had two hec of it. The land was given to him when he became the ward chief.

Most of the farmland in Singgut was planted with sugarcane. We all considered it the one crop that could flourish in any season. The price it fetched kept going up the more people there were. Everyone needed sugar. For cooking, for drinking, or, for people like Kyai Noto, to help sick people take their medicine. Besides, with sugarcane we didn’t have to
"What more do you want here? Bejo’s dead. What do you want? My life too!"
Oh heavens, what was wrong! Yu Tini was shouting so loud and everyone in the house could hear. Now they were all looking at us. What did she want? Why was she so angry?
What should I say now?
"Be patient, Yu. We’re all grieving for Bejo."
"Bejo died because of you. You caused him to die, didn’t you?"
Oh heavens, she was saying that I caused his death. Why did she get that idea? Why would she think that I caused his death?
The neighborhood unit chief came up to Yu Tini. He patted her on the back and asked her to calm down. "Let’s go, Yu."
Yu Tini yielded. She wasn’t shouting anymore, but speaking in a low voice. But I could still hear her very clearly.
"Bejo was an offering. An offering for a pesugihan."
Oh great heavens, now she was saying that Bejo was an offering for my pesugihan. What pesugihan? Oh Gusti, what misfortune had befallen me now?
I left the house. It felt like I had a boil on my chest. Full of pus and painful, and although I wanted to laugh at it, I couldn’t. I passed through the kitchen on the way out and gave 10,000 to Tonah, who was among those keeping vigil there. The money was for buying whatever was needed during those seven days. I didn’t know if the others had heard what Yu Tini had said. But I was sure that her shouting was enough to conjure up all kinds of stories in their minds.

25 a ritual to seek wealth


---
*Jalan berlubuk*

Offerings, wealth rituals, tuya, Mount Kawi—for years the people of Singget had spun tales about all of those things. It was a form of entertainment and recreation amid hardship. And now it was complete with Bejo’s death. Oh dear heavens... Gusi...

A week had passed since Bejo’s death. It was now the day of the election. Everyone, including Yu Tini, did their duty. Everyone went to the village hall and punched the yellow picture on the ballot. I went too. But, I didn’t have a single reason to take part in the election and vote for that party. What more could I have given? They asked for donations, I gave, they wanted my car, go ahead. Yet... when there was trouble, there wasn’t the least bit of help from the ward chief or from the state. Instead, everyone now thought that the accident was because of my pesugihan. Still, there was nothing for it; I didn’t want more trouble, I didn’t want to be labeled as not supporting the government, much less a PKI supporter, by not voting.

Once again the government party won the election. Well it was supposed to since everyone was required to vote for it. Just like before, there was a party that lasted all night. The difference was that before there was just dancing, but this time there was also a wayang kulit show. With entertainment like this, no wonder people always look forward to the election. Because without an election, when would there ever be a wayang show in Singget?

Things never got better after each election. The dirt roads that punctured the tires of our motorbikes and bicycles were never paved over like the roads in Madiun after the election.

Tubuh yang penuh dengan gambar tato itu kini berlumur darah. Kepalanya seperti dipukul dengan batu yang besar. Orang ini penjaga keamanan di Ngrang. Hmm... sebenarnya bukan penjaga keamanan. Tiap hari dia meminta uang dari pedagang kalau tidak dikasih dia akan membayar gara-gara. Demi keamanan, semua orang akan memberikan yang diminta.

Setiap ada uang pedagang yang hilang atau ada teriakan pembeli karena dicopot, semua orang akan curiga dia dan ge-roombolannya yang melakukannya. Dan sekarang dia mati. Polisi datang mengangkat mayat itu lalu membawanya entah ke mana. Semua orang tak ada yang peduli. Kematian ini disayangkan banyak orang.


Siang ini kami duduk di pawon sambil makan rujak yang kubeli di pasar. Aku bercerita tentang kematian Mali dan orang pasar itu. Dia terkejut dan sepertinya agak marah.


"Aduh, Gusri! Yuk, hati-hati di sana. Di kota orang jahat lebih banyak."

"Justru karanya mayat-mayat itu penjahat. Maling, rampok:
tidak. Lha wong hewan saja bisa kawin, bisa punya anak, masa manusia tidak bisa kawin gara-gara punya cap PKI.


Aku sudah berdandan, memakai kain batik dan brokat hijau yang baru kubeli di Solo. Malam ini, tamu-tamu yang besok siang tidak bisa jagung mulai datang. Mereka membawa

19 undangan
20 pisang haya makan atau dan minum air putih
34 jenas