Strengthening Women’s Participation and Representation in Governance in Indonesia [SWARGA]

POLICY RESEARCH
Factors in Declining Women’s Political Representation in Parliament and the Intervention Made Prior and Post the General Election 2014

PHENI CHALID (LEAD RESEARCHER)
LANNY OCTAVIA (RESEARCHER)
ISNIATI KUSWINI (RESEARCHER)
1. **SITUATION ANALYSIS**

Women’s participation and representation in decision making bodies at executive and legislative levels has been reflecting one of a long process of women’s struggle in the public sphere. In the first democratic election in 1999, women comprise only 8% of the 500 members of the national parliament. When gender quota legislation was introduced in the next election in 2004, with no sanctions for non-compliance, women’s proportion increased slightly to 11.3% of the 550 members. In 2009, wherein the failure in meeting the 30% women quota disqualifies the political parties, women only constituted 18% votes in the national parliament (103 from 560), or one-third out of the total population of women.

General Election 2014 brought expectation on increasing women representation in legislative and more concern at the same time. Since the open list proportional representation system was introduced shortly prior the 2009 GE, wherein the candidates and the constituents were not familiar with this new system that relied on the most votes. In 2014 GE, the candidates and the constituents were aware with the system that was stipulated in the Law No. 8/2012 on the Election of Members of DPR, DPD, and DPRD. The Law No. 8/2012 was announced within 2 years to polling day. Nevertheless, the consequences of Proportional Representation Open List Electoral System delivered a very tight competition among legislative candidates within the same political party as well as cross-parties. The 30% women quota was ineffective in such election process, as both male and female candidates faced “free market” competition (without affirmation) to win the most votes.

In fact, women quota was endorsed more significantly by General Elections Commission’s regulation No 7/2013 that requires ‘the list candidates for MP to contain at least 30% of women’s representation in each electoral district’, and that ‘at least 1 in every 3 candidates included on a political party list should be a woman’. Political parties that do not meet the requirement are disqualified from submitting a list in the electoral district where the quota is not met. However overall political situation brought differently to the decline of women representation on 2014 legislative election.

In 2014, the National Parliament - DPR RI consists of 97 (17.3%) female, and 483 (86.3%) male members out of 560 seats. DPD RI consists of 34 (25.8%) female, and 98 (74.2%) male members out of 132 seats. The Provincial Parliament - DPRD Province consists of 335 (15.85%) female, and 1.779 (84.15%) male members out of 2.114 seats. The District/Municipal Parliament - DPRD Kabupaten/Kota consists of 2.406 (14.2%) female, and 12.360 (85.8%) male members out of 14.410 seats. PDIP has the highest representation of women in DPR RI 2014-2019, with 21

---

2. Puskapol.ui.ac.id
3. Article 24 (1) c and Article 27 (2) b, Peraturan KPU No. 7 Tahun 2013 tentang Pencalonan Anggota Dewan Perwakilan Rakyat, Dewan Perwakilan Rakyat Daerah Provinsi dan Dewan Perwakilan Rakyat Daerah Kabupaten/Kota.
4. Ibid
female MP out of 109 parliamentary seats (19.27%). Whereas PKS has the lowest representation, with only 1 female MP out of 40 parliamentary seats (2.5%).

Table 2. Women’s Representation Based on Political Party

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Party/Order</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>7</th>
<th>8</th>
<th>9</th>
<th>10</th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>Grand</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Nasdem</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>11.43</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PKB</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>21.28</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PKS</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>2.50</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PDIP</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>109</td>
<td>19.27</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Golkar</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>91</td>
<td>17.58</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gerindra</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>73</td>
<td>15.07</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Demokrat</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>21.31</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PAN</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>18.37</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PPP</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>25.64</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hanura</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>12.5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>97</td>
<td>560</td>
<td>17.32</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Thus, Women’s representation decreased as compared to the 2009 GE, which elected 103 female Member of Parliament (MP) in the National House of Representative - DPR RI (18.39%). In fact, there was a rise in the percentage of female candidacy from 33.6% in 2009 to 37% in 2014, as a result of General Elections Commission’s regulation No 7/2013 that is known as implementation of zipper policy in candidacy.

Previously in the 2009 GE, the 30% quota was assumed to be based on the national scale and not on the electoral district. Although the quota policy was more legally binding in 2014, women’s representation decreased in the 2014 GE. In this regard, SWARGA UNDP held a review to identify the factors that determines the declining representation of women in the parliament 2014 and the interventions provided by various institutions prior and post the election 2014, in order to formulate the future strategy and measures to strengthen women’s political participation and representation in Indonesia.

2. FACTORS IN DECLINING WOMEN’S REPRESENTATION IN 2014 GENERAL ELECTION

2.1 Electoral System Implementation and Political Party’s Policy as Presumption of Declining Women’s Participation

The decline of women’s representation raising stakeholders’ concern who are focused to women and gender issues as well as election issues. Presumption of the decline of women’s representation begin from electoral system and political party policy. Perludem observed on how political party policy influence women candidates,
particularly during campaign period.

The monitoring held by Perludem found that political parties did not provide sufficient assistance upon female candidates, who were less “aggressive” in the political campaign and funding than their male counterparts\(^6\). Furthermore, most of the female candidates were not prepared in securing their votes and they were particularly vulnerable to having their votes stolen throughout the manual recapitulation processes\(^7\). Political party’s omission in this case indicated its lack of commitment in supporting women’s political representation and its recruitment of women merely as vote gather. There must be an open government initiative, just as the Elections General Comission (KPU) shared all Election related data on internet in the last Presidential Election, which resulted in a more transparent and accountable voting recapitulation process.

Perludem also found that most of female candidates were placed in number 3, 5, and 6, whereas the 2014 GE result indicated that most of the elected MP were placed in smaller order numbers (nomor urut kecil). Out of 97 female candidates who were elected in 2014 GE: 46 of them were placed in number 1; 21 in number 2; and 15 in number 3\(^8\). Thus, majority of female MP (84.5%) were candidates with small order numbers, indicating that political party’s decision concerning the candidates’ order number is still crucial despite of the open list proportional representation system.

The large number of legislative candidates also complicated the constituents, who expressed confusion over the voting process\(^9\). In Banten 3 Electoral District alone, there were about 300 legislative candidates to choose for the national upper house of representatives and the national regional house, as well as the provincial and regional assemblies (DPR, DPD, DPRD Provinsi and DPRD Kabupaten/Kota)\(^10\). Some voters admitted that they didn’t know any of the candidates, particularly as their pictures were not published along with their names in the real ballots. Unsurprisingly, the voters tended to choose the candidates who were posed in the upper order number. Simplifying the electoral and political party system, by decreasing the seats in the electoral district and the parliamentary threshold in all levels, is necessary to ensure women’s more representation in the legislative bodies\(^11\).

Money politics that were prevalent in 2014 election campaign was also an obstacle for women’s political representation. Lax of campaign finance regulations allowed big donations to be channeled from anonymous individuals and corporations, with no legal restrictions\(^12\). As direct election system have forced the legislative candidates to organize and fund their own campaigns, women have to compete with men candidates who usually have stronger financial and political basis. In theory, women have been always associated with high moral standard such as honesty and clean politics. In practice, however, money was crucial in the electoral success since


\(^7\) Ibid

\(^8\) Ibid


\(^12\) http://www.iseas.edu.sg/documents/publication/ISEAS_Perspective_2014_20_A_Snapshot_of_the_Campaigning_in_Indonesia's_Elections.pdf

Policy Paper - Not for Circulation | 3
vote-buying were practiced among the voters, the legislative candidates, and also the election organizers\textsuperscript{13}. Regulation to limit the campaign funding and spending is needed to ensure equality among the candidates\textsuperscript{14}.

Political parties’ fulfillment of 30% women’s quota in 2014 GE was mostly just a formality. The research held by Perludem concluded that the political parties in the district/municipal level did not have sufficient female cadres and therefore they randomly recruited any women to fulfill 30% women’s representation in the legislative candidacy\textsuperscript{15}. Worse still, political parties did not have serious efforts to strengthen these ‘instant’ female candidates and to ensure their representation in the parliament. Most of the capacity and strategy buildings among female candidates were provided by non-partisan institutions\textsuperscript{16}. The beneficiaries considered that the quality and quantity of these external interventions were much better than the political parties’ initiatives\textsuperscript{17}.

On the other hand, majority of political parties did not sufficiently accommodate women in their organizational structures. Women represented less than 30% in most of political party’s executive board. Furthermore, women did not attain strategic position in the political party, i.e Department of Organization, Department of Cadre Preparation, or Election Campaign team (Bapilu). Usually, candidates who gained upper order number 1, 2, or 3 have a close connection with the political party elites. While female candidates with no special connection with the elites (probably they were not actively contributing to the political party) and no money would be placed in non-strategic order number. There terms ‘NPWP: Nomer Piro Wani Piro’ (decision on the order number depends on the candidates’ financial contribution) was often heard in the 2014 GE.

As in 2009 GE, political party elites have tended to place female family members (wives or daughters) on the candidate list and resorted to parachuting in female celebrities to meet the women quota requirements\textsuperscript{18}. Several women elected in 2014 were either celebrities or heiresses of political dynasties with a high level of popularity and electability, who served as effective vote gatherer for the political parties. Thus, the only option now is to strengthen these female MP, otherwise their bad performance would affect constituent’s distrust upon female legislative candidates in the future.

While women’s less participation in the political parties prevented them from gaining necessary structural support, women’s excessive involvement in the structure has also diverted them from building constituents’ support in their electoral district (i.e. the case of Nurul Arifin). Unlike PKS that unilaterally recruited and trained the team of poll monitors known as ‘witnesses’ (saksi) for all candidates, most political parties did not mobilize these witnesses in a neutral and transparent


\textsuperscript{14} Supriyanto, Didik et all (2013), \textit{Basa-basi Dana Kampanye: Pengabaian Prinsip Transparansi dan Akuntabilitas Peserta Pemilu}, Perludem


\textsuperscript{16} Among them is UNDP, Puskapol UI, Koalisi Perempuan Indonesia, Solidaritas Perempuan, Kemitraan, SFCG etc.

\textsuperscript{17} SFCG Evaluation Report (2015)

\textsuperscript{18} Warat, Natalia (2013). \textit{What Women’s Growing Political Representation Means in Indonesia}. asiafoundation.org
Thus, the internal friction among candidates of the same party was fiercer as the witnesses could favor a candidate who provide the most incentives.

In the case of PKS, women's representation was particularly decreasing (3 in 2009 GE and 1 in 2014 GE) due to internal regulation that prohibited both husband and wife to run in the 2014 General Election\textsuperscript{20}. PKS potential female cadres were generally married to equally potential male cadres, and therefore PKS loses many potential legislative candidates. As PKS policy prioritizes family over politics, thus female cadres were mostly the ones who decided to withdraw from politics. The internal crisis (the detention of former head of PKS in bribery scandal) also diverted the candidates' attention from the decision on order number.

Ledia Hanifa, the only female MP from PKS, stated that the most important thing to all cadres at that time was that PKS could pass the electoral threshold and survive in 2014 GE. The fact that she was posed in order number 3 in the candidate list of party number 3, apparently facilitated her campaign among women in the grass root level. Her electoral districts Bandung and Cimahi were also urban cities, in which voters were aware of the use of social media such as face-book and twitter.

In order to avoid the sanction, PKS did not fulfill 100% candidate lists in the electoral district. In the electoral district DKI 2, for instance, the seat allocation is nominated for 7 candidates. In other word, the party must nominate at least 2 female candidates in the list to fulfill the 30% women quota. Since it was hard to find female candidates, PKS nominated only 5 candidates in the list that includes 1 female candidate\textsuperscript{21}. Despite the Law on Political Parties No. 2/2008 has stipulated 30% women's quota in the political party structure, apparently it is still hard for political parties to find female legislative candidates.

In this regard, intervention toward political parties must be done by imposing the 30% quota in their structural statutes and rules (AD/ART). Only the newly established party, Hanura and Gerindra, which imposed this 30% quota to fulfill the requirement for the political party establishment. The rest of political parties that were established prior the issuance of Law on Political Party in 2008 have not adopted 30% women quota in their structures, with the exception of PPP. As a result, PPP women's representation has successfully increased from 5 in 2009 to 10 female MP in 2014. Lena Mukti from ANSIPOL argued that instead of being posed in the party structure like women's department and so on, women must be specifically posed in the executive board membership wherein the decision of party policies are made\textsuperscript{22}. 30% women quota must also be adopted in political party's guidance and rule, including in the cadre preparation.

### 2.2 Women’s Lack of Capacity

Elections in Indonesia have become an expensive undertaking for parties and candidates alike. Lena Mukti who served as MP in previous period and run for the election for several times, admitted that the 2014 GE was the dirtiest election in the

\textsuperscript{19} Ledia Hanifa, FGD 3/3/2015  
\textsuperscript{20} Ibid  
\textsuperscript{21} Lena Mukti, FGD 3/3/2015  
\textsuperscript{22} Ibid
Indonesian political history. She stated that only business women, celebrities, and political dynasty heiress could survive because money play a significant role\(^\text{23}\). Data collected by P3DI DPR RI found that 62% of the newly elected female MP were businesswomen, indicating that they have sufficient financial capital to compete in the electoral battlefield. In other word, one of the important ingredient to win the parliamentary seat is financial basis, which becomes a special challenge for female candidates who were mostly economically dependent upon their husbands/parents.

Nico Harjanto also observed that it was hard for women to run for the parliamentary seat, unless they are popular celebrities or heiress of political dynasties. Secondly, most of female candidates lack of networking with the local political operators or key persons who are influential among the constituents. Thirdly, the political messages of female candidates were usually intangible and not attractive for the constituents. The male candidates usually spoke about tangible aspect such as infrastructure, an issue which is considered attractive for the voters. Eva Sundari, for instance, was not re-elected in 2014 as she worked on unpopular or sensitive issue such as religious minority advocacy. Her works were not considered important by the constituents in her electoral district. It is necessary for female legislative candidates to wrap their issues and concerns attractively. Fourthly, women are usually lack of political aspiration. Before running for the parliamentary seat in the National/Provincial/District/Municipal level, it is important to encourage women to be involved in the village level parliament BPD (Badan Perwakilan Desa). Thus, the women’s quota can be applied also in the village electoral level in order to generate well qualified and experienced female candidates.

In terms of political capacity, most of female legislative candidates were new comers in the 2014 electoral battlefield, as they were recruited merely to fulfill the 30% women’s quota. They came from various educational and occupational backgrounds, with a little or no political knowledge and experience. Wahidah Suaib who facilitated the capacity building for female legislative candidates emphasize the importance of reviewing the training materials and methods. Some of the training participants viewed that the training was mostly provided in the form of monologue lecture and non-interactive testimonies. They wanted group participatory training and problem solving or strategy building that are more applicable in the field. Despite some political parties have a loose association with the mass organizations, it is hard for them to find female candidates as these organizations have not applied women’s quota in their structure. Some regional regulations that restricted women’s mobility, such as in Aceh and Gorontalo, also influenced women’s political participation in those regions. Not to mention negative/black campaign against female legislative candidates that is based on religious arguments.

### 3. INTERVENTIONS MADE PRE AND POST 2014 GENERAL ELECTION

Women’s lack of capacity also become the cause of declining women’s participation in the election, especially after the 2014 election. This is because most of female candidates were not well prepared in the village level parliament BPD (Badan Perwakilan Desa). They lack of networking and communication with the local political operators or key persons who are influential among the constituents. They also lack of political knowledge and experience. It is important to encourage women to be involved in the village level parliament BPD (Badan Perwakilan Desa) in order to generate well qualified and experienced female candidates. Despite some political parties have a loose association with the mass organizations, it is hard for them to find female candidates as these organizations have not applied women’s quota in their structure. Some regional regulations that restricted women’s mobility, such as in Aceh and Gorontalo, also influenced women’s political participation in those regions. Not to mention negative/black campaign against female legislative candidates that is based on religious arguments.
representation and one of the reason of interventions made for women’s candidates particularly at pre-election. Women candidates facing various obstacles that needed to be overcame. Regarding to the importance of women political representation, at least in number of seats gained, invited stakeholders to support women who ran through pre and post-election program and activities.

3.1 Advocacy to the Political Parties

The main key of strengthening women’s political participation and representation is in the hand of political parties. Political parties are the ones that have to recruit and select the legislative candidates, and provide political education for their cadres and constituents. Unsurprisingly, some of the political party elites protested against the 30% women quota law as it was hard for them to find well qualified female legislative candidates particularly in the district/municipal levels. In this regards, ensuring political parties’ commitment for women’s political participation is crucial to do long before ‘the electoral seasons’.

Prior the 2009 GE, TAF has developed database on potential women to be MP for political parties. 996 women candidates are made known to political parties as potential candidates. It is unknown however, whether those potential women were accommodated by the political parties. At about the same time, NDI worked with women’s wings of political parties at the national level to support women leaders. It was a strategic measure, despite it can be improved by empowering women’s wings of political parties at the provincial and district/municipal level. NDI also provided technical assistance to KPPI to broaden its membership base, fundraise for and sharpen its advocacy on women’s rights.

Table 2. Initiatives related to the Political Parties

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Institution</th>
<th>Method</th>
<th>Objectives</th>
<th>Activities</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>TAF</td>
<td>Database development</td>
<td>To identify potential women to be MPs</td>
<td>To introduce 996 potential women candidates to political parties</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NDI</td>
<td>Partnership and technical assistance</td>
<td>- Technical assistance to KPPI&lt;br&gt;- Training&lt;br&gt;- Worked with women’s wings of political parties at national level</td>
<td>- Provided technical assistance to KPPI to broaden its membership base, fundraise and training to candidates&lt;br&gt;- Advocacy in women’s rights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IRI</td>
<td>Training and advocacy</td>
<td>Support 30 female cadres to gain the policy making position in political parties structures</td>
<td>Advocacy and training for cadres of political parties</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SFCG</td>
<td>Workshops</td>
<td>Detailing the steps of action plan to support women candidates within</td>
<td>- Workshops 3 packages for 58 representatives of 10 largest political parties in targeted</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
In 2013, IRI provided leadership and advocacy training for female active cadres of political parties. Since the political parties in the regions did not actively maintain their membership database, the training was eventually held only for 30 participants or less than the expected 50 participants. This program was held to support women to gain the decision making positions in the political parties, which will influence the nomination of legislative candidates in the upcoming election. In June 2013, SFCG held 3 workshops for 58 representatives from the 10 largest political parties in 3 targeted areas Mataram, Tabanan, Bogor to build an action plan detailing the steps by which political parties can build support for females, both within political parties and among the wider community. Apparently, the participants of these workshop were not part of the political party elites who could ensure the implementation of those action plans. Ansipol and Kemitraan also held advocacy to strengthen women’s political participation to the political parties and Election Committee prior GE 2014.

### 3.2 Capacity Building for Female Legislative Candidates and Women MPs

Prior the 2014 GE, many stakeholders have provided capacity building to improve women’s capacities in running for the parliamentary seats. Among these stakeholders are Ministry of Women Empowerment and Child Protection (MoWECP) in cooperation with Kesbangpol of the Ministry of Home Affairs (MOHA), UNDP SWARGA project in cooperation with the Norwegian Embassy, The Asia Foundation (TAF) in cooperation with the Norwegian Embassy, Kemitraan in cooperation with the Netherlands and Danish Embassies, Search for Common Ground (SFCG) in cooperation with the European Union, and the US based International Republican Institute (IRI).

As described in the above table, most of the stakeholders provided the training for female legislative candidates in the national, provincial, and district levels. Only SFCG focused the training for female candidates who run in the district/municipal levels, as well as their husbands or male political party representatives. SFCG focused on the district/municipal level election as it has the lowest representation of women MP (12% in 2009), not to mention the fact that many other institutions have mobilized...
their interventions in the national and provincial levels. SFCG also involved the candidates’ husbands and male party representatives to gain their supports upon female legislative candidacy and campaign process.

Despite the capacity building had been provided for thousands of female legislative candidates, only less than 10% of them were elected to be members of parliament. Evaluation held by SFCG found that all of their successful alumni had sufficient social, political, and financial capital to run the electoral campaign. Most of them were candidate number 1 or 2 in their electoral district, indicating their strong bargaining position in their political parties (political capital). Some of them have been working on the social-economic empowerment of their communities for many years, providing them with large numbers of loyal voters (social capital). In addition, their position as head of the village or family members of respected religious leaders also benefited them in the campaign process. It appeared that some of them were spending more campaign funding as compared to the unsuccessful ones (financial capital). Thus, it can be assumed that 2-3 days training will not be sufficient for the female candidates to win the parliamentary seats without building their social, political, and financial capacities at the same time.

Furthermore, most training materials solely focused on the preparation to win the legislative seat, and not on increasing women’s political participation or representation in general. In fact, majority of these women were not elected as MPs, and they can exercise the political leadership in other level. Evaluation held by Kemitraan found that beneficiaries considered that the most useful material is concerning voting recapitulation system, division of electoral district, and mapping of the voters/constituents. The second important material is concerning effective communication. The third is concerning campaign strategy. The fourth is self-image building. The least useful ones is concerning the electoral laws. In this case, the absence of follow up activities among the non-elected female candidates seemed to make such initiative in vain. Effort to empower these training alumni to take leadership in the smaller scope, such as village, will be important to respond the Law of Village’s requirement for women’s participation and representation.

On the other hand, most of the materials were conveyed in a one-way communication approach, with a little opportunity of question and answer session or personal development. For many women who are new comers in politics, these materials were seen as too heavy particularly since these were delivered in a one way presentation method. Evaluation held by SFCG found that most beneficiaries appreciated its participatory and interactive method of training which developed their natural leadership and benefited them even after they were not elected as members of parliament. Some of the SFCG training alumni who were not elected, are now actively involved either in their political parties’ structure or in the community development activities. As seen in the above table, SFCG did not provided the materials similar to other institutions to avoid the overlapping content.

Most of the beneficiaries said that they wished they had these capacity buildings

25 PP No 43 Year 2014 concerning Law of Village, RPJMN 2015 - 2019
long before the GE in April 2014. Most of the stakeholders, however, held the training several months before the election. On the one hand, these activities depend on the funding approval that usually come closely prior ‘the election seasons’. On the other hand, the selection of training participants relied on the announcement of Fixed Candidates List (DCT). Otherwise, the training would be less effective if it was held for women candidates whose names would eventually unlisted in DCT.
### Table 3. Capacity Building for Women Legislative Candidates and Women Member of Parliament

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Institution</th>
<th>Participants</th>
<th>Activities</th>
<th>Contents/Subjects</th>
<th>Method</th>
<th>Duration</th>
<th>Areas</th>
<th>Electability</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>MoHA and MoWECP</td>
<td>12 batches</td>
<td>Training</td>
<td></td>
<td>Presentation, role play, case studies, games and ice breaking</td>
<td>3 days, 2 nights each event from Dec 2013- Jan 2014</td>
<td>Lampung, Banten, DKI Jakarta, DIY, Bengkulu, Bangka Belitung, Bali, Gorontalo and Central Kalimantan (9 Provinces)</td>
<td>21 out of 488 (4.3%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SWARGA</td>
<td>488 women candidates national, provincial and district level</td>
<td>Training 12 classes</td>
<td>- Women's political vision; - Electoral system and stages, Voting and seat recapitulation, Securing the Votes; - The electoral district, Personal Branding, Campaign Strategy</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TAF</td>
<td>1,041 women candidates at national, provincial and district levels across 11 provinces. This included special training requests from two political parties for their</td>
<td>Training 24 sessions</td>
<td>- Political system, electoral system, electoral district; - How to organize a campaign - Public speaking</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Jakarta, Aceh, Makassar, East Java</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agency</td>
<td>Gender</td>
<td>Training</td>
<td>Topics</td>
<td>Year</td>
<td>Location</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| IRI    | Female MPs | Training | - Roles of legislators  
- Mandate of legislators  
- Recess management mentorship  
- Media roadshow | 2013 | Aceh, North Sumatera, South Sulawesi, NTT, NTB |
| Kemitraan | 843 participants in training for female legislative candidates at national, provincial and district levels | Training | - Voting recapitulation, electoral district, and mapping of the voters; Effective Communication;  
- Campaign strategy;  
- Personal branding;  
- Electoral laws & regulation | 2012 | Jabodetabek, West Java, Central Java, Yogyakarta, Bali, West Sumatra, Aceh, North Sulawesi, Bangka Belitung (9 Provinces) |
| SFCG | 79 participants in the training for female legislative candidates in district/municipal levels and candidate husbands/male party representatives | Training | - Leadership, Gender inequality issues;  
- Problem solving and conflict resolution;  
- Communication skills | Nov 2013 | Bogor, Tabanan (Bali), Mataram (NTB) 3 districts |

**POST ELECTION**
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Organization</th>
<th>Number of Female MPs</th>
<th>Level</th>
<th>Training</th>
<th>Topics</th>
<th>Location</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>SWARGA</td>
<td>333</td>
<td>DPRD</td>
<td>Training</td>
<td>Legislation, Budgeting, Oversight, Communications, Gender, Decentralization issues</td>
<td>Lampung, Banten, Yogyakarta, Bengkulu, Gorontalo, Bangka Belitung, Central Kalimantan, Bali, West Nusa Tenggara, North Sumatera and South Kalimantan (DPRD at 11 Provinces, DPR and DPD)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TAF</td>
<td>241</td>
<td>Provincial</td>
<td>Training</td>
<td>Discussion, Policy debates</td>
<td>Jakarta, Aceh, Makassar, East Java</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>592</td>
<td>CSO</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Conducted in 47 cities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IRI</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Training</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Furthermore, there are some overlapping areas of intervention, for instance in Jakarta, Yogyakarta, Bangka Belitung, Bali, Aceh. With a more or less similar training curriculum and method used by most of the stakeholders, such overlapping initiative would be a waste of resources unless the stakeholders managed to include different participants in each training session. On the other hand, areas with the least representation of women (<10%) such as West Sulawesi, West Kalimantan, Papua, North Maluku were out of the intervention outreach. Thus, coordination and networking among stakeholders should be held prior the intervention to optimize the capacity building impact and widen the area coverage across the country. This situation need to be noticed for designing strategy of intervention. Institutions or agencies should consolidate in formulating strategy, program and areas of intervention to gain effective result towards future election.

### Table 4. Overlapping Areas of Pre-Election Intervention

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Areas of Intervention</th>
<th>UNDP</th>
<th>TAF</th>
<th>IRI</th>
<th>Kemitraan</th>
<th>SFCG</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Aceh</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DKI Jakarta</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DI Yogyakarta</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bali</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bangka Belitung</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South Sulawesi</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>West Nusa Tenggara</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>West Java</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Post the election, some stakeholders also provided capacity building for the elected female MPs. IRI for instance, held training before the inauguration of female legislative members. Based on its experience in 2009, after the inauguration most of those MPs would not join the training, probably because they were busy with their new tasks or did not think it was necessary anymore. Apparently, only the new and unpopular elected MPs wanted to join the training. IRI encouraged them to be active in the assembly meetings, and to take strategic positions in the commissions, the factions, and the council to lobby the interest of women or their electoral district.

SWARGA also trained newly elected women MPs on their basic parliamentary roles, which is based on the result of prior training needs assessment (TNA). Its TNA indicated that there are needs to strengthen cooperation between MPs and CSOs; to build the capacity of MPs in their legislative roles; to improve communication between MPs, local authorities, and constituents; and to raise MPs’ awareness and knowledge on the formulation of gender sensitive legislation. The module refers to case studies, and it is written in simple language along with illustrations, graphs, and matrix to further simplify the topic. SWARGA also held advance training for female MPs with the focus on their main functions in the legislation, supervision, and
budgeting; networking; and strengthening their integrity and accountability.

In addition, SWARGA also initiated round-table discussion to establish Women Parliamentary Caucus (KPP-RI) for 2014-2019, attended by 52 female MPs. SWARGA planned to further facilitate bimonthly round-table discussion with resource persons from various background. SWARGA also strengthened the capacity of members and staff of KPP RI and held 2 days national seminars to strengthen Women Parliamentary Caucus (KPP) and Women Parliamentary Network (JPP). In this case, a baseline survey has been held to build a communication system for information sharing among female MPs both in the national and regional levels.

Aside from the conventional training, TAF held interactive discussion and policy debates that involves both female and male members of parliament in 47 cities. On the one hand, the policy discussions/debates provided new awareness on the necessity of producing gender sensitive laws and regulations to the newly elected members of parliaments as well as the incumbents, to the female as well as male member of parliaments. On the other hand, the interactive sessions also indirectly build the MPs’ capacity to communicate their ideas effectively and to fight for the interests of their constituents particularly women.

IRI for instance, tailored the activities in accordance with the MP’ interests. As a result, IRI held recess management mentorship and media roadshow as the MPs wanted to know how to conduct a good recess and introduce themselves to the local media. Each area has different issue to address and therefore IRI use different approach, syllabus and program design. In the future, IRI planned to ensure more women to be involved in the policy making positions in the political parties. It also planned to strengthen local CSO, NGO, and media so that they can assist these female MPs.

### 3.3 Building Voter’s Support toward Female Leadership

Building the capacity of women legislative candidates will not be sufficient in ensuring their representation in the parliament without mobilizing public support for women’s political participation and representation. In the open list electoral system, particularly, the parliamentary seat is determined by the highest vote at the electoral district. Some stakeholders like Swarga and Kemitraan produced and distributed Public Service Advertisements (PSA) calling the public to vote for women legislative candidates. TAF held radio campaign in the form of PSA and talk shows that aired in 30 national and 300 regional radio stations. SFCG held an animated video campaign in the social media such as facebook, twitter and youtube. The real outreach and effectiveness of these public campaign efforts, however, can only be measured by audience survey right after the end of the projects.
### Table 5. Public Campaign Activities

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Institution</th>
<th>Objectives</th>
<th>Method/Types of Campaign</th>
<th>Media Campaign</th>
<th>Areas</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>SWARGA</td>
<td>To outreach voters to vote women candidates</td>
<td>- PSA (Public Service Announcement) and advertorial Talkshows</td>
<td>- Women magazine, Social media, TV Public events</td>
<td>Jakarta, Lampung, Banten, Bengkulu, Bangka Belitung, Kalteng, Gorontalo, Bali, Yogyakarta</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Increasing visibility of women candidates Mobilize public support</td>
<td>- Morning exercise with women candidates in targeted areas - Feature writing competition on Women Representation and Quota</td>
<td>- Gimmick to participants (T-Shirt, pen, etc)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TAF</td>
<td>- Increasing visibility of women candidates Mobilize public support</td>
<td>- PSA through Radio - Constituent meetings - Talkshows</td>
<td>- Collaborated with Radio KBR 68H - Involving 30 national and 300 regional radio stations. Three hundred radio stations across Indonesia aired 39,626 PSA - Outreached 1,147 people</td>
<td>10 targeted provinces</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SFCG</td>
<td>To engage women candidates with potential voters</td>
<td>- Community engagement forum - Animated video campaign through social media (Youtube and Facebook) with material (“The road to women’s ideal representation”, “Time for women to speak up”, “Mengapa</td>
<td>- Facilitating women candidate meeting with communities participating 60 participants each forum</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Aside from media campaign, TAF organized constituent meetings in 10 targeted provinces that were attended by 1,147 people. SFCG held 5 community engagement forums in 3 areas, with 60 participants each, to mediate the female candidates with their constituents and to provide them political education. In the first hour SFCG provided political education, and in the next two hours it opened the chance for dialogue between the trained female candidates and constituents in the electoral district. The materials included the importance of politics, why constituents have to participate in politics, and the identification of the constituent’s interest to be conveyed directly to the female candidates; the conflict management and the election; the strategy of voting and avoiding money politics; and the roadshow to the House of Representative and political parties to convey their women’s interests.

Political education among women in the grassroots level is very important as they have the least access to information. With the implementation of Law of Village, it is increasingly important for these women to organize and formulate their interests, and to ensure gender responsive policy, program, or budget. Women have to be actively involved in the decision making process in the village level and therefore raising their political awareness is very crucial at this point.

3.4 Advocacy for Gender Sensitive Regulations

Strengthening women’s political participation and representation in the decision making bodies is important because women’s experiences and interests are different from men’s. Women have to be sufficiently represented so that the parliament could establish gender-responsive policies. However, survey held by Kompas indicated that 62,5% respondents considered that women representatives did not contribute well, as they did not pay attention upon several strategic sector such as the legislation concerning women migrant worker and education27.

Thus, aside from capacity building to support women’s political representation, some stakeholders like Kemitraan also held the advocacy on regional regulation concerning the achievement of MDGs. In West Java, Kemitraan successfully inserted and increased the budget allocation for KIBA: Kesehatan Ibu dan Anak (Maternal and Child Health) to 25% in 2012. In Manado, Kemitraan held the advocacy on regional regulation concerning visum et repertum for the victims of sexual violence.

---

27 wri.or.id
Table 7. Gender Sensitive Policy Advocacy

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Institution</th>
<th>Policy Advocacy</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>TAF</td>
<td>Facilitated civil society to advocate gender sensitive regulations in those target provinces. Over 20 local regulations on protection of victims of violence, support for safe motherhood and education and health support for the poor were enacted in Aceh, East Java and South Sulawesi.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kemitraan</td>
<td>Held MDGs policy advocacy with CSOs and women's group including: the budget allocation for Maternal and Newborn Health in West Java, and free medical examination for the victims of sexual violence in Manado. Held research on the performance of female MP in 2009-2014: the laws' accommodation of women's interest.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The policy advocacy is enabled as Kemitraan collaborated not only with DPR-RI women members, DPRD Province women members, DPRD II women members, but also with women Empowerment CSO Networks, MDG's CSO Network, Provincial Government, Municipal/Regent Government, Academics, KPI, IPC, Bali Sruti, WCAOB, WABTI, Suara Parangpuan, Konsorsium Yogya, Konsorsium Jabar. Kemitraan built networking in each region, and got endorsement from the DPD of West Java that provided the office for regular discussion among women activists and politicians from cross-political parties, which become an important women resource center. The involvement of civil societies is important as they have more knowledge and high commitment to fight for regulations that correspond the local needs.

TAF also facilitated civil society to advocate gender sensitive regulations in those target provinces. Over 20 local regulations on the protection of victims of violence, support for safe motherhood and education and health support for the poor were enacted in Aceh, East Java and South Sulawesi. In strengthening women’s political participation, TAF collaborated with The Center for Political Studies, Faculty of Social and Political Science, University of Indonesia; Partners of Indonesian Women (Mitra Sejati Perempuan Indonesia, MISPI); Institute for Public Policy Studies (Lembaga Studi Kebijakan Publik, LSKP); Institute for Research – Center for Law and Human Rights Studies, University of Airlangga (Penelitian dan Pengabdian Masyarakat, Pusat Studi Hukum dan HAM, LPPM-PUSHAM UNAIR); Radio 68H Network; The People’s Voter Education Network (Jaringan Pendidikan Pemilih Rakyat, JPPR); and Women’s Journal Foundation (Yayasan Jurnal Perempuan, YJP).

4. RECOMMENDATION

Declining of Women Representation become prominent issues after hard effort from stakeholders are implemented. Hence it is important to design a systematic overall review on the issues incorporated with developing strategy to enhance women representation toward future election 2019-2024. Therefore, SWARGA require to conduct a policy research to identify the factors in declining women representation.
representation during legislative election 2014 and to formulate feasible future strategy to gain significant women seats gained. In a set of research method.

Before the policy research formulated comprehensively, policy research will be focused on: 1) women representation policy, particularly in Election Legislative 2014; 2) interventions made upon women candidates; 3) future strategy toward next election to prepare more comprehensive support to women who run in election. Therefore, research context will be expected on:

I. Women Quota Policy during Election 2014

1) How far the regulation on women quota and electoral system implementation in Legislative Election impact to the women seats gained in Election 2014. The research should make inquiry on open/closed list proportional system, 30% women quota in the political party’s structure, implementation of electoral regulation and endorsement of electoral committee at national and sub-national level. Description upon the dynamics on women struggle and endorsement from stakeholders during election 2014 will be the preliminary information to explain the decline of women representation.

2) Identify the cross-cutting issues on women’s representation and implementation of UU No. 6 Tahun 2014 and Peraturan Pemerintah No. 43 Tentang Peraturan Pelaksanaan UU No. 6 Tahun 2014. The policy context is intended to seek whether women political career can be started in the village governance context, hence women participating in politics begun from their immediate environment. It is equally important to review about the gender policy advocacy and action that correspond local interest and context as a lesson learned and to extrapolate future recruitment mechanism women in politics through the existing condition.

3) Identify the political party policy and mechanism of candidates’ selection and accommodation of women in the decision making position (executive board), and the role of women’s sections in each political party.

4) To identify the problem mentioned in section 1,2,3 research should gain the related documents, papers, research result, policy papers, etc and conduct the desk review followed by designing sets of method.

II. Interventions

1) Identify the comprehensive types and activities of intervention, methods, areas, agencies who delivered, etc to gain comprehensive map of interventions on support program for women candidates and women MPs during Election 2014.

2) Training is the favorable intervention method conducted by agencies. Regarding to two sessions FGD result, found that training implementation occurred some overlaps in areas, subjects and methods. Therefore, it is important to review on training materials, followed by review on overall
training to evaluate whether the trainings conducted are required by the women candidates or women MPs who participate in politics. If the training is necessary and required, on what context, subjects, method and areas should be implemented. Training review result is important identification to seek the overall strategy to support women toward future election.

III. Candidates and Women MPs Background

1) Research should identify the background of women candidates and women MPs. The identification of women MPs is important to understand the complexity and obstacles that women candidates experienced. Where they came from, prominent or wealthy families, business entities, popular celebrities, heiress of political dynasty and else. On contrary, what happened to candidates and women MPs who do not have sufficient capital to compete in electoral battlefield. Understanding of women MPs overall background and obstacles will lead to analysis on how far these variables impact the success or failure of women candidate to gain seat in parliament.

2) To link the analysis whether intervention meet the women MPs requirement to overcome the competition during election 2014. Therefore, research enables to find the loopholes between strategy of intervention, women MPs capitals and obstacles, political party policy and stakeholders endorsement. Furthermore, research enables to provide data to develop strategy to meet beneficiary demand and intervention models.

IV. Strategy toward Enhancing Women Representation on Election 2019

1) To provide a set of comprehensive strategy intervention in term of policy, support program, issues and methods towards election 2019.

2) To prepare recommendation to stakeholders and its competency to interlink in implementing their support program and activities.